Influencing Change in Municipalities Through Leadership: A Case Study of the City of Tshwane Municipality

KM Sebidi
University of Limpopo

SM Madue
Pro-Active Public Services College (Pty) Ltd

Abstract: This paper seeks to highlight leadership challenges in South African municipalities from an organisational culture and leadership perspective, using the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality as a case study. The research questions guiding this paper are: Why is service delivery remaining a challenge amidst the existence of regulatory and institutional frameworks in South African municipalities? How can leadership be used to influence change in the municipalities? In South Africa, local government has undergone numerous reforms, yet elements of bureaucracy are still highly prevalent. Bureaucratic structures like municipalities require employees with behaviours that enable them to take decisions that are suitable to address specific issues in different situations while at the same time being compliant with the legislation that governs them. Municipalities are then faced with a challenge of not having flexible and innovative leadership that is willing to boldly take calculated risks to address the challenges of service delivery within the legal framework. This paper posits that there is a need for a culture change to allow flexibility, innovation in leadership to ease the tension between these bureaucracies on the one hand and change of outdated organisational culture methods of providing services on the other hand. This paper argues that leadership can influence organisational culture as it tries to address service delivery challenges in South African municipalities.

Keywords: Culture, Leadership, Municipalities, Service delivery and Challenges

1. Introduction

The Constitution of the Republic of South African 1996 is one of a few constitutions in the world that has a Chapter dedicated to the principles and values governing public administration. Principles and values governing public administration are enshrined in Chapter 10 of the Constitution, Section 195(1), thus Davidson (2003:30) argues that the old methods of acquiring and developing business have changed and new models for leadership and management have been called for. Such changes require local government leadership and management to be far more knowledgeable on their business area, and more competitive on how they approach and cope with the changing environment which is characterised as complex, uncertain, multi-faceted, and heterogeneous. Pavlov and Kutsamunska (2004:3) state that it will take more than technical skills to be a successful a leader in government; this is in contrast with the traditional notion that most leaders in government were appointed through their experience and technical skills. Nowadays, technical expertise is the least important of the required set of leadership attributes for the local government executive staff members. The benefits of reforms in local government can be realised when public servants can be given an opportunity to "manage by results" in a flexible way. Schein (1992:379) is of the view that an organisation that needs to change requires a person who can change the old culture.

The new approach requires government executives and public servants at large to have core managerial qualification and leadership attributes (Pavlov & Kutsamunska, 2004:3). These authors further mentioned that managers stress consistency and reliability, while leaders develop strategies to inspire a shared vision for the future and align stakeholders with the larger vision. Part of this transformation process at a local government level in South Africa has been to ensure that municipalities become more responsive to the needs of the community (Thobejane, 2010:1). Municipalities require leadership that will create, support, implement, manage, and demonstrate through their behaviour the organisational culture and values consistently in providing effective service delivery (Schein, 1990:109). In South Africa, according to the White Paper on the Transformation of the Public Service (also referred to as the Batho Pele White Paper, 1997), paragraph 2 on Principles serves as guidelines for leadership...
Influencing Change in Municipalities Through Leadership: A Case Study of the City of Tshwane Municipality

and good governance in the public service. According to these principles, public service leadership should specify the level of quality and quantity of service to be rendered and must include processes and outcomes. Chapter 6 of the Municipal Systems Act: Act 32 of 2000 prescribes that municipalities will have a "performance management system" to promote a culture of performance management amongst the political structures, political office bearers, councillors and administration. Given the above background, this paper seeks to respond to the questions: why is service delivery remaining a challenge amidst the existence of regulatory and institutional frameworks in South African municipalities? How is the change in leadership affecting organisational culture in the City of Tshwane? This paper is anchored on the Organisational Culture theory to explore the influence that leadership change has on organisational culture in the City of Tshwane. Adom (2018:439) posits that the function of the theoretical frameworks is to inform the research design and guide the research approach and methodology.

2. Background on the City of Tshwane Municipality

The City of Tshwane (hereinafter referred to as Tshwane) is the capital of South Africa and is the largest municipality, as measured by land mass. Tshwane, has 105 wards, 210 councillors and about 2.5 million residents, and is divided into seven regions. Tshwane covers 6 368km² of Gauteng's 19 055km², as illustrated in Figure 1 above and stretches almost 121 km from east to west and 108 km from north to south.

Tshwane is the third-largest city in the world in terms of land area, after New York and Tokyo/Yokohama. As the administrative seat of Government and hosting numerous Embassies, Tshwane has proven to be a leader on the African continent in providing affordable industrial sites, various industries, office space, education and research facilities (http://www.tshwane.gov.za). It is among the six largest metropolitan municipalities in South Africa and the second largest in Gauteng, as measured by Gross Domestic Product (GDP). Tshwane covers 6 368km² of Gauteng's 19 055km² and is ranked fifth by population size of 2.9 million residents. Tshwane consists of seven regions made up of 105 wards and 210 councillors. The City has a vibrant and diverse economy, which enables it to contribute at least 26.8% of the Gauteng Province's GDP and 9.4% of the GDP of the national economy (http://interactive2.statssa.gov.za). The city is taking active measures to firmly position itself as Africa's leading capital city of excellence.

3. Theoretical Perspectives

A theoretical framework is important as it explains why the study exists, and it responds not only
to the aims and objectives of the study but also aimed at answering the research question of the study. The theory adopted in this study is the contingency theory as it is deeply rooted in various concepts of organisational literature which borders the study (Sauser, Reilly, Shenhar & Donaldson, 2003:25) where organisational culture finds space as organisations have cultural properties that breed meaning, values, and beliefs (Allaire, Mihaella & Fisirotu, 1984:194). The adoption of Contingency theory is based on the premise that the research is based on organisational culture which contributes to Organisational Behaviour in a Municipality which is expected to provide services to the community in a manner consistent with legislation, especially the constitution of the country. Woodward (1965:15) developed the contingency theory as a behavioural theory and stressed that there is no best way to manage. Scholars (Reids & Smith, 2000; Haldma & Laats, 2002; Badara, 2017) agree with this statement and further point out that there is no perfect way to provide a good management accounting system, but rather it depends upon some contingencies which the institution has to respond. Different situations require different types of leadership. Therefore, the strength of contingency theory is that it provides management flexibility (Northouse, 2007:91). Barnard (1968:94) defines an organisation as a system of consciously coordinated activities. The City of Tshwane as an organisation is structured in a manner that is bureaucratic and having red tape type of processes in getting things done.

4. Considering an Organisational Culture Model

The study of theories of organisational culture is often difficult due to the lack of concrete evidence on various cultures. That being said, organisational culture is being regarded as an atmosphere that pervades the interior of a company or association (Allaire, Mihaila & Fisirotu, 1984:195). These theories attempt to explain the phenomenon that occurs in and around individuals and its intangible characteristics include values, assumptions, and norms, and are defined differently depending on the mission of the organisation. The contingency theory seeks to suggest that culture is important in the public service including municipalities, especially Tshwane as it is undergoing an administrative and leadership change process (from the African National Congress (ANC) to the Democratic Alliance (DA post 2016 Local Government Elections) and or a major introduction of major reforms or new culture or value traits exhibited in the past. An organisation with a predominantly internal process like municipality might find it difficult to accept reforms, and change aimed at promoting innovation, to improve service delivery. Municipalities are faced with a challenge of changes brought by the new democratic process and Public Administration reforms which affect how things were done before the changes. Managers and employees of these public institutions are faced with changes in technology and innovation in their daily work. These institutions have strategies, problem solving, decision making and plans to implement, and that's where culture shift and adaptation becomes essential for organisational effectiveness. Managerially and critically minded organisational researchers assume that resistance to change is rooted in cultural stability or, in critical terminology, that resistance to managerial oppression can be rooted in the solidarity of working class culture (Bate, 1997:1155). Hatch (2004:1155) voices the managerial side of this conundrum when he claims that debilitating cultural hangovers from the past play havoc with day-to-day management processes.

A better approach to changing culture would be to acknowledge and participate in the culture's own dynamic processes, fitting one's ambition into the flow of stability and change from which the culture itself is constituted. This involves, perhaps above all else, a simultaneous focus on what will be preserved (and how) and what will be changed. This study adopted Schein's Culture model which considers culture to be a three-layer phenomenon as illustrated in Figure 2 on the following page.

According to Parker (2000:125), organisational culture management as a tool of consultants and as a management method is often a direct continuation of Taylorism, work rationalisation and efficiency thinking; an attempt is made to develop control mechanisms that are not based on compulsion or on direct orders. In functional theories, culture is considered to exist as an ideal towards which one must strive towards and which one can and must manipulate in the company's interests. Glendon and Stanton (2005:193) classify Schein's organisational culture model as belonging to the interpretational theories.

Organisational culture has some effects on democracy and such effects need to be known and
Schein (1992:40) argues that the leadership in the organisation needs to communicate the organisational objectives and strategy to employees, so that leadership must not be seen as the only people who understand and have the responsibility of implementing the organisational strategy. Employees need to be involved in the formulation of the organisational strategy and policy through representatives of their choice. Such leadership promotes participatory democracy in the workplace, encourages recognition and promotion of inclusive organisational values, and the use of a code of conduct. When organisational leadership communicates strategy and objectives to employees in a participatory manner that allows feedback and support, it creates a culture of teamwork and service that impacts on effective, efficient and economic performance. Employees need to be clear about their purpose and objective of being in the organisation, what is expected of them and how to perform those activities. Having considered an organisational culture model, it is thus important to use it to determine the organisational culture challenges that the City of Tshwane might be having.

### 5. Organisational Culture Challenges in the City of Tshwane

Nzewi et al. (2016:42) posit that organisational culture as a variable has generalisable attributes in both public and private organisations. This is because in so far as organisations are social institutions (Bedeian, 1980:4), the principal basis of organisational culture (humans and human interaction) is integral to all organisations including municipalities (Zamanou & Glaser, 1994:476). Kanyane (2014:89) states that municipalities including the City of Tshwane are under pressure to meet the basic needs of the society, due to limited budgets and lack of technical capacity. The need to improve performance was underpinned by the State's acceptance of the municipal service delivery challenges that to access descent municipal services was no longer a privilege to be enjoyed by a few. The State's incapacity to provide basic services is a challenge in developing countries including South Africa (Wallis & Dollery, 2001:247). Therefore, leadership skills and inadequate technical expertise in the running and provision of services remain major challenges in the South African municipalities. These challenges are the results of the inability of the leadership in municipalities to adapt in a rapidly changing and competing environment coupled with high expectations from communities to get a better life for all through service delivery. Powell (2012:16) confirms that the government was expected to do more with less resources and reminds us that the intervention by the former State President Thabo Mbeki through Project Consolidate, attempted to address crumbling skills base by deploying expertise in all affected municipalities. The organisational culture prevailing in municipalities has some effects on service delivery. The effects may either be positive or negative. In this instance, effects of organisational culture need to be handled accordingly.

---

**Figure 2: Schein's (1992) Model of Organisational Culture**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artefacts</th>
<th>Visible organisational structures and processes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Espoused Values</td>
<td>Strategies, goals, philosophies (espoused justifications)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underlying Assumptions</td>
<td>Unconscious, taken-for-granted beliefs, perceptions, thoughts, and feelings (the ultimate source of values and action)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors
culture in the City of Tshwane appear to adversely affect service delivery.

6. Service Delivery Challenges

Before identifying and discussing service delivery challenges, it is important to revisit the definition of the concept ‘delivery’. On the one hand, Wyld (1961:1394) defines the act of delivery as “... producing or performing, handing over, taking goods to the intended recipient, or producing results as promised or expected”. On the other hand, Riekert (2001:90) explains that "... service delivery is concerned with the provision of a product or service by government or government body to a community it was promised to, or which is expected by that community". In Tshwane, the provision of housing is a major challenge as the city is affected by urban migration and occupation of unserviced land and illegal electricity connections that affects Spatial Planning. The challenge is fuelled by a shortage of skilled public officials in key positions who can address these challenges. Furthermore, key senior posts remain vacant and in some cases are occupied by unqualified incumbents. Budgetary constraints exasperated by poor payment of basic services and high rate of unemployment affects the municipality's effort to generate revenue. Hanekom et al. (1987:11) are of the opinion that the real core of public administration is the basic services performed for the public, such as policing and the protection of property. Scholars such as Schein (1985:25), Deshpande and Webster (1989:3) suggest that organisational functioning cannot be adequately understood by myopically examining traditional models or organisational behaviour that generally incorporates organisational, task, structure and people but not culture. They argue that organisational culture can impact and even determine organisational behaviour and its effectiveness among competitors. This view is supported by Ouchi and Wilkins (1985:457), Peters and Waterman (1982:20) and Webster (1993:30). Service delivery stays in the strong site with intangible aspects of an organisation, that is, what makes the organisation excel. The objectives of the study are explained.

7. Research Methods

The study employed a mixed method approach to benefit from the strengths of both the qualitative and quantitative research methods. The approach of mixed methods in social sciences research is applied in this research as it necessitates the researcher to use both approaches as supported by De Vos et al. (2005:271), Hurmerinta-Peltomaki and Nummela (2006) in McKim (2017:203) elaborate that the mixed methods approach adds value by increasing validity in the findings that are informed by the collection of the second data sources and assists with knowledge creation. Mouton and Marais (1996:20), refer to epistemological dimension as a "search for the truth". The methodology of this study was planned to ensure that the research results are true and presents a practical reality of the situation at the City of Tshwane Municipality. Riccucci (2008:6) explains that "Public Administration is a field of study that has historically generated a rich body of qualitative research, often empirically based (e.g. descriptive, case studies)", hence this study uses the City of Tshwane as a case study. Mouton and Marais (1996:21) refer to the ontological dimension as the domain, therefore the research domain of this study is restricted to culture among employees, their feelings, perceptions and attitudes and how it affects the way they provide services to the public. Gibson et al. (2012:6) state that the study of Organisational Development (OD) from which organisational culture emerged relies heavily on recognised disciplines. The scientific method is important in studying variables (in this study culture and service) and relationships. As the scientific method has been applied in similar studies to research on organisational development, a set of principles and guidelines on what constitutes good research has emerged. The analyses of numeric data collected is customary in quantitative research, and the narration or interpretation of that numeric data is a norm in qualitative research in answering the research question (Creswell, 2003; Johnson & Onwuegbuzie, 2004:16). The instruments used for collecting data were questionnaires and structured interviews.

7.1 Population and Sampling

The overall population of the study comprised of the employees of the City of Tshwane. The total population was 37321 and the study focused on the Corporate Shared Services Department which has a population of 466 employees. In this study, the sampling was limited to 300 general employees for control and management of the data collection, to enable less interruption of business operations. In this study, both purposive and random sampling
methods were used for data collection purposes. To ensure the validity of the quantitative data to be collected, a random sampling was done through a questionnaire distribution to the entire Shared Services and Group Human Capital Management Departments in the City of Tshwane Municipality. According to Williamson, Karp, Dalphin and Gray (1982) and Babbie (1998), the advantage of random sampling method is that each element of the population has an equal chance of being included, further that a complete listing of all population elements will be available, and that means the sample frame will be developed. Through purposive sampling the study selected 1 Group Head, 2 Divisional Heads, and 5 Directors in Shared Services; Group Human Capital Management (GHCM): 1 Group Head, 3 Divisional Heads and 5 Directors chosen as representatives of the general sample.

7.2 Data Collection Methods

The primary instrument for data collection for the research was a questionnaire which focused on both culture and service delivery as the two variables of the study. A culture questionnaire was used for the measurement of the independent variable (organisational culture). A survey was used as an organisational culture measurement instrument where feedback was obtained from all employees of the City of Tshwane Municipality, including managers to determine if changes brought about after the 1994 Democratic elections and 2016 Local Government Elections, improved their operations and internal processes in rendering services to public. According to Denison (1990), researchers state that surveys as organisational culture instruments assess organisational focus (internal and external focus) and organisational flexibility (flexible and stable). Denison argues that this approach allows for assessment of the ways in which organisations (or sub-groups within organisations) deal with seemingly contradictory or paradoxical goals and demands. In this study, a questionnaire for the independent variable (service delivery) was designed and validated prior to its usage. Since a questionnaire is a lengthy instrument and may take time to administer, a decision was taken to obtain a perception rating of service delivery in the identified sample.

7.3 Validity and Reliability of the Study

To ensure that validity and reliability is being maintained, the quantitative questionnaire was piloted before it was administered to the whole population. The data collection was administered by the researcher to ensure that participants understood how to complete the questionnaire. This view is supported by Kimberlin, Winterstein & Almut (2008:2281) who posits that reliability and validity evidence from established instrument is applicable only if you use the instrument in the same form and follow the same administration procedures as used in the validation process of the study. Similarly in this study the verification of data was achieved through prolonged data collection and member-checking to attain credibility; identification of resemblances in the findings for purposes of transferability and assessing dependability (Lincoln & Cuba, 1985). While rigour amplifies the need for reliability and validity, it is argued that reliability and validity relate better to quantitative than qualitative research (Morse et al. 2002; Twycross & Shields, 2005). The factor structure of the questionnaire in this research is firmly supported by exploratory factor analysis.

To measure the dependent variable (service delivery), the questionnaire was designed and validated prior to the actual implementation of the research to assess organisational culture and service delivery. The survey questions contained closed-ended questions involving a set of responses from the respondents, such survey response includes categories of agree, strongly agree, neither agree, and disagree Mouton and Marais (1996:69). There was an open-ended questionnaire specifically for Group Heads; Heads of Departments and Directors their understanding of organisational culture and service delivery in the Department of Shared Services in the City of Tshwane Municipality.

8. Findings and Analysis

The correlation procedure for the analysis of the findings is presented in Table 1 on the following page.

The Pearson correlation method was performed to test if there is correlation between Service delivery and Organisational culture. The pearson “r” coefficient ranges between (-1,1), with values close to 1 indicating a high correlation. –r implies that there is negative correlation between the variables measured and a positive +r implies that there is positive relationship, i.e. if results increase the out-performance also increases.
In Table 1, we can see the correlation = 0.85956 and is significant at 0.05 implying that the statistical correlation between Service delivery and Organisational culture, i.e. if the Organisational culture score increases also the Service delivery increases or vice versa. The same principle can be used to interpret the correlation between sub dimensions as depicted in Figure 3 above.

An interpretation of Table 2 on the following page reveals that the regression analysis is significant; the p (value) is > 0.00. This indicates that organisational culture predicts Service delivery. In other words, organisation culture predicts 74% of the variance of the service culture.

The relationship between service delivery and organisational culture in the City of Tshwane is shown in Figure 4 on the following page.

In Figure 4, the results indicate that organisational culture has an influence on service delivery in the City of Tshwane. A deduction can thus be made that the leadership at the City of Tshwane Municipality needs to focus attention on addressing the operational issues of its employees. Organisational culture is seen as a contributing factor to the overall performance of the organisation. Therefore, while there are political and resource dimensions to challenges faced by the municipality, the leadership at the City of Tshwane Municipality need to focus on institutional dimensions will mean that current organisational level practices have to change in order to uncover these culture traits (Ndzewi et al., 2016:41). The findings indicate that there is a considerable understanding of strategic intent in terms of the purpose of the municipality through the IDP. Additionally, departments that deal directly with the public (e.g. services) recognise the service delivery to the public as their core mandate. Although there is some value placed by individual units on working together towards a common goal, employees within these units feel mutually accountable to each other. It can therefore be deduced that organisational culture influences the level of client service delivery of employees in the City of Tshwane.

The findings on leadership suggest that the accounting officer did not exercise adequate oversight
responsibility regarding compliance with laws and regulations and related controls, which resulted in instances of non-compliance with the MFMA and SCM regulations. As far as Financial and performance management is concerned, senior management was found not to be implementing sufficient monitoring controls in compliance with legislation and that the financial statements were supported by credible information, which resulted in material adjustment to the annual financial statements and material non-compliance with key legislation. There were no controls in place to ensure that the annual performance report was supported by valid, accurate and complete information. There were no engagements conducted by various parties that have or could potentially...

Table 2: Correlation, Service Delivery and Organisational Culture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Observations Read</th>
<th>145</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of Observations Used</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Observations with Missing Values</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Analysis of Variance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F Value</th>
<th>Pr &gt; F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>34.04904</td>
<td>34.04904</td>
<td>401.74</td>
<td>&lt;.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Error</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>12.03493</td>
<td>0.08475</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corrected Total</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>46.08397</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Root MSE 0.29112  R-Square 0.7388
Dependent Mean 2.35758  Adj R-Sq 0.7370
Coef Var 12.34840

Parameter Estimates

| Variable               | DF  | Parameter Estimate | Standard Error | t Value | Pr > |t| Standardized Estimate |
|------------------------|-----|--------------------|----------------|---------|-------|-----------------------|
| Intercept              | 1   | 0.02538            | 0.11886        | 0.21    | 0.8312 | 0                     |
| Organisational Culture | 1   | 0.97394            | 0.04859        | 20.04   | <.0001 | 0.85956               |

Figure 4: Fit Plot for Service Delivery and Organisational Culture

Source: Statistician report
have an impact on the municipal entity's financial statements, reported performance information and compliance with applicable legislation and other related matters. The concerns mentioned in the Group Audit and Risk Department, Audit and Performance Committee (Quarter Two 2017/18) page 8 noted that Line Departments often fail on effective consequence management and that there are a number of outstanding investigations. Schein (2012:25) states that if managers fail to manage subcultures in an organisation, the managers end up being managed by these subcultures. Sebedi (2012:67) argues that managers should walk the talk and manage if they are to lead.

9. Conclusion and Recommendations

The results of both organisational culture and service delivery questionnaires administered within the City of Tshwane Municipality as part of the Public Administration have assisted with the rationale behind confirming the research objectives. The study argues that there is a correlation between organisational culture and service delivery in the City of Tshwane Municipality. The primary recommendation for this study is that the City of Tshwane Municipality as a service organisation needs strong leadership that will not only stress excellent service to customers by employees but management that will walk the talk. Schneider, Briefs and Guzzo (1996:15) explain that there is a need within any service orientated organisation for management that will communicate new service values and beliefs needed in changing daily service practices and procedures, imparting knowledge, skill and guiding employee activity “how things are done around here”. Negative Subcultures end up frustrating the overall organisational culture that will impact on service delivery. Therefore, this study recommends that there should be consequence management for transgressions of the laws and procedures in the City of Tshwane. The leadership in the City of Tshwane should be vigilant and have a zero-tolerance approach to non-compliance to governance issues. Sebedi (2012:67) further states that Managers should live the values and culture of the organisation if they are to lead. In conclusion, the major finding of this study is that there is a strong correlation between organisational culture and service delivery in the City of Tshwane Municipality. Arrival at this finding has been achieved through the use of both the quantitative and qualitative research techniques. The research was not only aimed at addressing the management of the organisation, but also to add value to the scholarship of Public Administration and organisational culture.

References


Influencing Change in Municipalities Through Leadership: A Case Study of the City of Tshwane Municipality


