

**AN EVALUATION OF THE EFFECTIVENESS OF THE INTEGRATED
DEVELOPMENT PLAN ON SERVICE DELIVERY
WITH REFERENCE TO THE EMFULENI LOCAL MUNICIPALITY IN
GAUTENG**

by

HULISANI CEDRIC MUKWEVHO

MINI-DISSERTATION

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF DEVELOPMENT DEGREE (MDEV)

in the

**FACULTY OF MANAGEMENT SCIENCES AND LAW
(Turfloop Graduate School of Leadership)**

at the

UNIVERSITY OF LIMPOPO

Supervisor : Dr. O Mtapuri

2012

DECLARATION

I declare that the mini-dissertation hereby submitted to the University of Limpopo, for the degree of **Master of Development Degree (MDev)** has not previously been submitted by me for a degree at this or any other university; that it is my work in design and in execution, and that all material contained herein has been duly acknowledged.

H C Mukwevho (Mr)

Date

DEDICATION

I dedicate this work to my entire family for their love and support during my studies, my wife in particular, **Erica Mukwevho**, for her continued support and inspiration during my academic life, my parents **Mr & Mrs Mukwevho**, who raised and educated me, and my sons, **Uatshila and Uatshidza Mukwevho**, for their intrinsic motivation to me to succeed during my studies. I also dedicate this paper to all South Africans who are directly and indirectly affected by the state of service delivery and by poverty.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to thank the almighty God who gave me strength and courage to be able to complete my studies, and my supervisor, Dr O. Mtapuri, for encouraging, motivating and guiding me throughout my study.

My profound thanks go to Emfuleni Local Municipality officials, councillors and the entire community for affording me the opportunity and their viable time to interview them and filling in the questionnaires in pursuit of my studies.

I am extremely grateful to my colleague Marthie Labuschagne for her support and assisting me in typing, alignment and other related logistics to the document. May God richly bless her.

My appreciation and sincere gratitude go to my family, my wife Erica Mukwevho for her support, love and being a pillar of my strength, my parents Mr and Mrs Mukwevho for educating me and the moral support shown throughout my studies and my sons Uatshila and Uatshidza Mukwevho for their intrinsic motivation.

May God richly bless them all.

ABSTRACT

The study has been prompted by the initiative of the Local Government of South Africa in introducing the Integrated Development Plan in local municipalities in 1998 as an interim integrated plan. Local Municipalities in South Africa have to use “integrated development planning” as a method of planning for future developments in their areas. Apartheid planning left South Africa with cities and towns that have racially divided business and residential areas; are badly planned to cater for the poor; have long travelling distances to work and poor access to business and other services; have great differences in levels of service delivery between rich and poor areas; have sprawling informal settlements and spread-out residential areas that make cheap service delivery difficult. Rural areas were left underdeveloped and largely unserved.

The aim of the study was to evaluate the impact of the IDP on service delivery in Emfuleni Local Municipality. The objectives of this study were: to evaluate the effectiveness of the IDP on service delivery and its implementation; to assess the capacity of the municipality to meet the IDP objectives and targets; to investigate the perceptions of the Emfuleni Local Municipality ward and Proportional Representative (PR) Councillors on their mandate and service delivery; and to identify and recommend strategies to enhance the effectiveness of the IDP on service delivery. The study was qualitative in design and collected data using interviews.

The study found out that the public participation process, the Integrated Development Plan, service delivery protests and state of service delivery in Emfuleni has clearly shown that the Emfuleni Integrated Development Plan does not have significant impact on service delivery.

Based on the findings of the study, the following recommendations are made: that there should an alignment of projects with community needs, establishment of a monitoring and evaluation unit, strengthen the intergovernmental relations system and regular feedback, communication and interaction with communities. These systems and structures will ensure that there is regular and coherent participation and involvement of the community as far as possible.

ACRONYMS

ANC	African National Congress
CBOs	Community Based Organisations
Cllr	Councillor
DA	Democratic Alliance
ELM	Emfuleni Local Municipality
ID	Independent Democrats
IDP	Integrated Development Planning
MFMA	Municipal Financial Management Act
MSA	Municipal Systems Act
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organisations
PGDS	Provincial Growth and Development Strategies
PPPs	Public Private Partnerships
PR Councillor	Proportional Councillor
SDBIP	Service Delivery Budget Implementation Plan
Stats SA	Statistics South Africa

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE

1.	Introduction and background	1
1.0	Introduction.....	1
1.1	Community participation in the IDP process.....	2
1.2	Statement of the problem	3
1.3	Aim of the study.....	4
1.4	Objectives.....	4
1.5	Research questions.....	4
1.6	Definitions of concepts	4
1.7	Significance of the study.....	5
1.8	Outline of the research report.....	5

CHAPTER TWO

2.	Literature review	6
2.0	Introduction.....	6
2.1	The new planning system in South Africa.....	6
2.2	Planning a historical perspective	9
2.3	The status quo of service delivery	10
2.4	The role and responsibility of municipalities	11
2.5	Pro-poor local economic development	12
2.6	Public private partnership as a mechanism to deliver basic services	13

2.6.1	Informal sector solutions.....	14
2.7	Creating pro-poor PPP's and their policy implications	16
2.8	Role of government agencies	16
2.9	Service delivery and budget implementation plan	21
2.10	Public participation and integrated development planning.....	23
2.10.1	Public participation	24
2.10.2	Facilitation of community participation in municipal process	27
2.10.3	Constraints in public participation.....	28

CHAPTER 3

3.	Research methodology.....	29
3.0	Introduction.....	29
3.1	Study area	29
3.2	Population	30
3.3	Sample size and selection method.....	30
3.4	Data collection methods	31
3.5	Data analysis.....	31
3.6	Ethical considerations.....	31

CHAPTER 4

4.	Presentation and interpretation of results.....	33
4.0	Introduction.....	33
4.1	Community participation process in the IDP process	33
4.2	Understanding the concept of the IDP.....	37
4.2.1	Perspective of officials.....	37

4.2.1.1	Unfunded mandate from national and provincial departments ..	38
4.2.1.2	Financial constraints.....	38
4.2.1.3	Collection rate	40
4.2.2	Perspective of councillors.....	40
4.2.3	Perspective of members of the community.....	41
4.3	Service delivery challenges at the municipal level.....	41
4.4	State of roads in Emfuleni Local Municipality	44
4.5	Limited delivery regarding infrastructure development	46
4.5.1	Housing	47
4.5.2	Water.....	48
4.5.3	Community facilities.....	49
4.5.4	Uneven service delivery	49
4.5.5	Lack of monitoring and evaluation, feedback and accountability	49
4.6	Positive developments.....	50
4.7	Realisation of the objectives of the study	57
4.8	Conclusion.....	59

CHAPTER 5

5.	Recommendations.....	60
5.1	Alignment of projects with community needs.....	60
5.2	Establishment of monitoring and evaluation unit	60
5.3	Strengthen the intergovernmental relations system	61
5.4	Regular feedback, communication and interaction with communities	61

References	62
Appendices	66
Letter requesting participation in the research project.....	66
Research questionnaires.....	68
PICTURES	
Figure 1	43
Figure 2	45
Figure 3	46
Figure 4	46
Figure 5	47
Figure 6	48
Figure 7	49
Figure 8	51
Figure 9	51
Figure 10.....	52
Figure 11.....	52
Figure 12.....	53
Figure 13.....	53
Figure 14.....	54
Figure 15.....	54
Figure 16.....	55
Figure 17.....	55
Figure 18.....	56
Figure 19.....	56
Figure 20.....	57

Tables

Table 1: Community participation process, 2001 - 2004	34
Table 2: Emfuleni Regional structure	35

CHAPTER ONE

1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1.0 Introduction

The study has been prompted by the initiative of the Local Government of South Africa in introducing the Integrated Development Plan in local municipalities in 1998 as an interim integrated plan. Local Municipalities in South Africa have to use “integrated development planning” as a method of planning for future developments in their areas.

Apartheid planning left South Africa with cities and towns that have racially divided business and residential areas; are badly planned to cater for the poor; have long travelling distances to work and poor access to business and other services; have great differences in levels of service delivery between rich and poor areas; have sprawling informal settlements and spread-out residential areas that make cheap service delivery difficult. Rural areas were left underdeveloped and largely un-serviced.

The new approach to local government is developmental in nature with the purpose of overcoming the poor planning of the past. Integrated Development Planning is an approach to planning that theoretically involves the entire municipality and its citizens in finding the best solutions to achieving good long-term development. An Integrated Development Plan is a super-plan for an area that gives an overall framework for development. It aims to co-ordinate the work of local and other spheres of government in a coherent plan to improve the quality of life for all people living in an area. It should take into account the existing conditions and problems and resources available for development. The plan should look at economic and social development for the area as a whole. It must set a framework for how land should be used, what infrastructure and services are needed and how the environment should be protected.

All municipalities have to produce an Integrated Development Plan. The municipality is responsible for the co-ordination of the IDP and must draw in other stakeholders in the area who can impact on and/or benefit from the development in the area. Once the IDP is drawn up, all municipal planning and projects should happen in terms of the IDP. The annual council budget should be based on the IDP. Other government departments working in the area should take the IDP into account when making their own plans. It should take six to nine months to develop an IDP. During this period service delivery and development continues. The IDP is reviewed every year and necessary changes can be made. The IDP has a lifespan of five years, which is linked directly to the term of office for local councillors. After every local government election, the new council has to decide on the future of the IDP. The council can adopt the existing IDP or develop a new IDP that takes into consideration existing plans. The executive committee or executive mayors of the municipality have to manage the IDP. They may assign this responsibility to the municipal manager. The IDP has to be drawn up in consultation with different fora and stakeholders. The final IDP document has to be approved by the council (Local Government Municipal Systems Act no, 32 of 2000).

1.1 Community participation in the IDP process

For the past years, the Emfuleni Local Municipality (ELM) has been involving its community during the IDP process. During the development of the initial IDP, the IDP term of reference was developed and is known as IDP process plan. The IDP process plan lays down the foundation for how the IDP review process will unfold. The process outlines the activities to be executed and timeframes during the review process.

It identifies all the role players who participate, and the activities and duration of activities to be executed during IDP reviews. The process plan involves councillors, officials, ward committee, sector departments and the community as a whole as its participants in the development, planning and implementation of the IDP.

The process plan also advocates for the establishment of the following structures: an IDP representative forum, an IDP Steering Committee and various project task teams. The Emfuleni Local Municipality has therefore established the IDP Steering

Committee structure, which comprises all members of the Mayoral Committee, Senior officials (Section 56 Managers) and a representative forum of representatives of all political parties in the council, that is, the African National Congress (ANC), the Democratic Alliance (DA), the Pan African Congress (PAC), the Freedom Front Plus (FF+) and the Independent Democrats (ID). The Steering Committee is chaired by the Executive Mayor.

The Municipality conducted the IDP review of 2001/02 and 2003/04 by making use of consultants. There were no dedicated officials in the municipality responsible for the IDP sections. Stakeholder consultation was done in the form of Representative Forums where all sectors departments, Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs), Community Based Organisation (CBOs) and the private sector were involved to take part in the IDP process. Between the 2001/02 and 2004/05 financial years, the IDP process as well as the consultations were done under the umbrella of the Sedibeng District Municipality. This on its own created confusion within the district, especially amongst the stakeholders. Questions of clarity, inputs and comments were handed over to the district, even issues that should have been directed to local municipalities. Three different municipalities within the district were involved as participants of the IDP process and stakeholders.

1.2 Statement of the Problem

In the past nine years, there have been numerous protests and marches with regard to the state of service delivery in the Emfuleni Local Municipality. Members of the local community have written petitions complaining about the state of service delivery, the deterioration of infrastructure, and non-performance of the municipality. The Emfuleni Local Municipality has been adopting and approving its Integrated Development Plan since the inception of the concept in 1998 but the protests and marches continue, even though the Integrated Development Plan is considered a strategic tool or document that gives direction to the municipality and priority needs. There is, therefore, an apparent disjuncture between the IDP and the priorities of citizens, which has both social and political costs.

1.3 Aim of the Study

The aim of the study is to evaluate the impact of the IDP on service delivery in Emfuleni Local Municipality.

1.4 Objectives

The objectives of this study are:

- To evaluate the effectiveness of the IDP on service delivery;
- To evaluate the implementation of Emfuleni Local Municipality Integrated Development Plan;
- To assess the capacity of the municipality to meet the IDP objectives and targets;
- To investigate the perceptions of the Emfuleni Local Municipality ward and Proportional Representative (PR) Councillors on their mandate and service delivery; and
- To identify and recommend strategies to enhance the effectiveness of the IDP on service delivery.

1.5 Research Questions

The research questions for this study are:

- How effective is the IDP process in delivering services?
- How is Emfuleni Local municipality implementing the Integrated Development Plan?
- What capacity has the Municipality to meet the IDP objectives and targets?
- What perceptions do Emfuleni Local Municipality ward and Proportional Representative (PR) Councillors have about their mandate and service delivery?
- What strategies can be recommended to enhance the effectiveness of the IDP on service delivery?

1.6 Definitions of Concepts

- The *Integrated Development Plan* is the Municipal five year strategic plan.
- Priorities are categorised needs of the community.

- Community beneficiaries' members of the community who benefited from project implemented by Emfuleni Local Municipality.

1.7 Significance of the Study

The importance of this study is to assist in identifying the shortcomings that exist in the Municipality as far as implementation of the Integrated Development Plan is concerned and develop a turnaround strategy that may assist the municipality to spruce up its processes for the benefit of the citizens in terms of service delivery.

1.8 Outline of the Research Report

Chapter 1: Introduction

Chapter 1 outlines the background and the justification of the study in order to form the basis for understanding this research. This is followed by the problem statement with an indication of the objectives of the study and research questions.

Chapter 2: Literature Review

This chapter is basically the section in which the researcher indicates the relevance of the topic under investigation and the arguments and contradictions by different scholars about the topic. It highlights the challenges faced by municipalities in terms of service delivery, the importance of the Integrated Development Plan as well as the challenges pertaining to public participation in this plan.

Chapter 3: Research Design and Methodology

Chapter 3 outlines the research design and the methodology that were followed during the research process. The chapter identifies the targeted group, sampling method and size of the population as well as research techniques used for data collection, analysis and so forth.

Chapter 4: Presentation and Interpretation of Results

Chapter 4 presents the results of this study. It unpacks the information as provided by the respondents regarding their livelihoods through the use of different techniques such as tables and pictures.

Chapter 5: Conclusion and Recommendations

This chapter concludes the study and makes recommendations in line with the aim and objectives of the research.

CHAPTER 2

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.0 Introduction

According to the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (Section 152 and 153), local government is in charge of the process of development in municipalities and also of municipal planning. The constitutional mandate to municipalities, to relate their management, budgeting and planning functions to their objectives, gives a clear indication of the intended purpose of municipal integrated development planning. The Constitution also demands that local government must improve intergovernmental coordination and cooperation, to ensure integrated development across three spheres of government.

The White Paper on local government (1998) gives municipalities the responsibility to work with communities and groups within communities to find sustainable ways to meet their social, economic and material needs and improve their quality of life.

The Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000 (MSA) defines integrated development planning as one of the core functions of a municipality in the context of its developmental orientation. The MSA requires the IDP to be strategic and inclusive in nature. The IDP should link, integrate and coordinate other plans while taking development proposals into account. It should be aligned with the municipality's resources and capacity, while forming policy framework on which annual budgets are based. The integrated development plan must be compatible with national and provincial development plans and planning requirements.

2.1 The new planning system in South Africa

The new planning system in South Africa is continuing to evolve through a learning process and in response to broader shifts in governance and macro policy approaches. Until recently, the IDP was seen almost entirely as an instrument of local planning and coordination (although there was a requirement that the IDP be aligned to national and provincial policies and programmes). However, from 1999, when Thabo Mbeki became president, a new emphasis was working its way through

government. This was an emphasis on integrated (or joined-up) multi-level governance. Issues of integration have been a cornerstone of the second term of democratic governance under President Thabo Mbeki (Harrison, 2003).

It is still difficult to evaluate the effect of IDPs on developmental outcomes. Has the integrated development planning process produced more integrated and participatory ways of working – more joined-up government – and has integration (if it has occurred) led to more effective delivery of services, and to more effective responses to problems such as poverty, HIV/AIDS, crime and spatial fragmentation? It will take a while before we are able to provide clear answers to these questions. There have, however, been a number of evaluations of IDPs sponsored by DPLG, GTZ and provincial government (Harrison, 2003). These evaluations point to modest success for IDPs even if many problems and challenges remain. They suggest that, increasingly, local authorities are beginning to shape the way they operate around the IDP and this may be leading towards more effective development local government (Harrison,2003).

An important contribution by Todes (2004) evaluated the IDP in terms of its contribution to sustainability. Using the case of the Ugu District Municipality IDP in KwaZulu Natal, Todes found mixed outcomes. She concluded that “while the emphasis on integration and the multi-sectoral approach to development are strengths, greater attention needs to be given to environmental aspects, and the form of planning needs to be adapted to the context, and its social, economical and political dynamics” (Todes, 2004:843).

The IDP has many of the strengths and flaws of other Third Way planning instruments. As an instrument of joined-up government it has been limited by its inability to involve and bind many other agents, apart from municipal government, that operate at the local level, although the emerging system of intergovernmental planning may address this issue. However, the IDP process has contributed to the development of networks and linkages, both formal and informal, within municipal structures and, to a lesser extent, between municipal structures and other agencies (Harrison,2003).

As an instrument of participatory governance, the IDP has had mixed results. It has, undeniably, achieved a higher level of participation within municipal planning than ever before in South Africa's history (Adam & Oranje, 2002) but there have been wide variations in the extent and success of this participation. Also, the participatory element of the IDP mixes uneasily with a performance management culture, driven by targets and time-frames, that is not really amenable to the often "messy", unpredictable and time-consuming processes of public participation (Adam & Oranje, 2000). The IDP attempts to marry inclusiveness and participation with largely technocratic managerialism, and top-down control with bottom-up processes. In the end it may not prove satisfactory in relation to any particular objective, although it may justifiably be regarded as offering a reasonable balance or trade-off between objectives (Adam & Oranje, 2000).

As an instrument of modernised, efficient administration the IDP has also had ambiguous outcomes. Like New Public Management (NPM) approaches elsewhere, New Public Management is a management philosophy used by governments since the 1980s to modernise the public sector. South Africa's new system of local government is full of paradoxes and unexpected outcomes. One of the aims of the NPM is to increase the flexibility and independence of senior managers. However, performance management contracts have given politicians far greater control over senior officials, and the civil service in countries under sway of the NPM which has become increasingly politicised. In South Africa, there has been a strong motivation for local politicians to assert this control to take control of a civil service where apartheid old guard was still strongly represented and then because of growing factionalism within the local ANC structures (Gregory & Christensen, 2004; Hood & Peters, 2004).

For planning to result in effective implementation, it is necessary to have the relevant organisational structuring of the resources available to the municipality. This requires the proper organisation of both internal and external resources. (IDP Guide Pack I – V, 2003)

A municipality must give effect to its Integrated Development Planning and conduct its affairs in a manner which is consistent with its Integrated Development Plan (Municipal Systems Act, 2000)

2.2 Planning a historical perspective

Historically, local municipalities in South Africa were often characterised by separation between planning and implementation, for example separate departments with own agendas/programmes, sectoral allocation and control of resources, resulting in efficient and inappropriate use of scarce resources, hierarchical and pyramid structuring of planning and implementation resulting in bureaucratic decision making, delaying implementation, and often, favouring support rather than delivery departments. (Yusuf *et al.*, 2003)

The IDP helps the local municipality to focus on the most important needs of local communities taking into account the resources available at the local level. The local municipality must find the most cost-effective ways of providing services and money to be spent on the causes of problems in local areas. The IDP identifies the least serviced and most impoverished areas and points to where municipal funds should be used. Implementation is made easier because the relevant stake holders have been part of the process (Yusuf *et al.*, 2003).

The IDP provides dead-lock breaking mechanisms to ensure that projects and programmes are efficiently implemented. It helps develop realistic project proposals based on the availability of the resources (<http://www.etu.org.za>).

Local government in South Africa has come a long way from the period when there were large numbers of racially segregated municipalities. In 2000, more than 8,000 municipalities were merged, to form the current 284 municipalities. These municipalities cover all local economies and must extend these services to areas of responsibilities that were previously neglected by municipalities. It is a matter of fact that in South Africa, infrastructure and basic public service backlogs do exist in most sectors, and the distribution of basic public services is very unequal, especially for people living in the rural areas (Khosa, 2000).

To ensure improvements in the effective and efficient delivery of public services in especially the local government sphere, the government of the day will have to take note of the most urgent challenges and address them in a more co-ordinated and proactive manner, focusing on macro goals, in such a way that the whole country benefits (Khosa, 2000).

This chapter will highlight the typical nature and extent of the delivery of basic public services in the municipal areas by local government authorities, after which it will identify some pressing South African realities, dynamics and challenges relevant to this sphere of government. It will review the roles and responsibilities of the municipalities, IDP processes, public participation, local economic development and finally private-public participations (PPP's).

2.3 The status quo of services delivery

The South African local government sphere is expected to provide basic services and improve the lives of people at a grassroots level. The big question is, what is happening at the implementation level? Many of the larger municipalities have worked hard over the past five years at creating democratic and accountable government. This has involved the complete overhaul of the governance model that existed before 2000, when a new system of local government was introduced. They have also improved on their delivery of basic public services such as potable running water, reliable electricity, user-friendly roads and effective waste collections services in former township areas, and have upgraded infrastructure in better-resourced neighbourhoods of the respective communities in their areas of jurisdiction. But many challenges operate at the most village. There are now new pressures on cities and local authorities to compete for investment with other cities and local authorities in the immediate surrounding area, province and country as well as in the other parts of the world. As foreign investors look for new sites, South African cities and local authorities will have for example, to offer increasingly sophisticated telecommunications and freight infrastructure, a desirable quality of life and pool of highly skilled workers (Khosa, 2000).

2.4 The role and responsibilities of municipalities

It is of utmost importance to first understand that in South Africa, municipalities are categorised as follows: Category A municipalities (metropolitan municipalities) such as the City of Johannesburg; Category B, local municipalities such as the Emfuleni Local Municipality, and lastly, Category C, district municipalities such as the Sedibeng District Municipality.

The differences between a metropolitan city, secondary city, large town, small town and rural dense settlement can be determined from the typology of urban settlements in South Africa, in the Cities Report of 2006. Metropolitan cities, such as the City of Johannesburg, are characterised by a population of over one million, an established formal core of industrial, commercial and suburban development, formal townships, hostels and backyards.

Secondary cities such as Bloemfontein are characterised by having between 250 000 and one million residents, an established formal core of mining, commercial and suburban development, formal townships with backyards, plus informal and traditional settlements and significant RDP housing on the periphery. Large towns are characterised by populations between 25 000 and 250 000, and small towns are characterised by a population of between 2 000 and approximately 25 000.

With these categories in mind, one can proceed with the search for more clarity on the nature and extent of basic municipal services at the local level in South Africa.

According to part B of schedules 4 and 5 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, municipalities are responsible for the regulation, management and provisioning of the key municipal services within their respective demarcated geographical areas of jurisdiction. These include: beaches and amusement facilities; billboards and the display of advertisements in public places, building regulations; cemeteries; funeral parlours and crematoriums; child-care facilities; cleansing; control of public nuisances; control of undertakings that sell liquor to the public; decisions around land use; electricity and gas reticulation facilities; the accommodation, care and burial of animals; fencing and fences; fire-fighting services; and the licensing of dogs (Khosa, 2000).

It is interesting to note that a national sample survey in South Africa by the Human Sciences Research Council in 1998 revealed that 41% of the respondents placed crime prevention at the top of their needs agenda to improve the quality of life for all. The creation of jobs came second and the need for government to provide better services was the third most important priority of these public services. The respondents identified the provision of running water as the most crucial basic need (27%), then came affordable housing (20%), while the provision of electricity and health care came in at 16% each (Khosa, 2000).

2.5 Pro-Poor Local Economic Development

In planning for development, in one of the most unequal societies in the world, the South African government is placing considerable emphasis on what it terms “developmental local government” increasing the role of government agencies in promoting growth and development, thus entrenching an essentially pro-poor policy focus. The government argues that the central responsibility of municipalities is to work together with local communities to find sustainable ways to meet their needs and improve the quality of their lives (RSA, 1998).

Pro-poor development/LED is encouraged through a range of key policies and laws. Key within this arrangement and assignment of responsibilities are the 1994 Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP), the 1998 Local Government White Paper and the 2000 Municipal Systems Act. These identify the key development role for municipalities; they assign developmental powers and enshrine obligations such as the need for participatory development and the need to prioritise the requirement of the needy communities in planning.

The key basis for all legislation in the country is the national Constitution of the country (RSA, 1996). In terms of local government affairs, the Constitution recognises them as a distinctive sphere of government and mandates them to give priority to the basic needs of the community, and to promote the social and economic development of the community. The Municipality Structures Act (RSA, 1998) makes provision for three categories of local government.

The Municipal Systems Act (RSA, 2000) indicates that municipalities are specifically required to involve communities in the affairs of the municipality, to provide services in a financial and sustainable manner and to promote development in the municipality. The integrated development planning process requires an economic and spatial development component, promotion of participation and appropriate institutional and funding mechanisms based on international experience. (Miguel, 2009).

2.6 Public Private Partnerships as mechanism to deliver basic services

Public Private Partnerships (PPPs) are defined as an agreement between the public and the private sector for the construction of public infrastructure or the delivery of a public services in which resources, risks and responsibilities are shared among both partners (Miguel, 2009).

The partnership can take different forms, with the risks and potential rewards distributed according to the capacity of each partner to bear them. In any of these forms, participation of the private sector in the provision of basic services and infrastructure is now common in most developing countries. The private partnership in infrastructure project database has identified 3 793 of these projects, amounting to US\$ 1 091 billion during the period 1990 to 2006. Latin America has received more investments than any other region, but these have also been very common in Asia (Miguel, 2009).

Miguel (2009) argues that Public Private Partnerships are often advocated as an effective mechanism for delivering water and sanitation services. At the same time it is argued that in developing countries the private sector lacks the incentives to extend services to the poor and that PPPs may only be able to improve services for the better off. Globally, millions of people lack access to water and other basic services. Water and sanitation services are usually delivered through state-owned utilities, but most of them are inefficient, under-funded and unable to expand services as required.

In this context, developing countries around the world see PPPs as a viable strategy to reform the utilities and improve service delivery. PPPs combine the public interest

of the Government with the efficiency of the private sector and have the capacity to increase the quality of the service while reducing government expenditure. However, PPPs have not always been successful, especially in relation to the extension of the services to poor people, and as a result private participation in the water sector is often treated with suspicion if not with open political hostility (Miguel, 2009).

Millions of people still have no access to water, despite the fact that many of them are willing and able to pay an adequate price for the services. In fact, many of the poor are already paying high prices for their water, either in cash through the informal market or in kind through time wasted and foregone income opportunities. Very few private companies have identified this market as a growing business opportunity (Miguel, 2009).

One of the most important barriers that prevents the development of a water market for the poor is the legal status of the customers. The fact that many poor people have no legal title over their houses and are often treated with eviction increases the risks of investing in installing pipes and other fixed assets. In some cases, the potential customers can have an illegal status in the place where they are living, which prevents any company from entering into formal agreements with them. Illegal immigrants are the most clear example, but in some countries internal migrants also need official permits to live in cities (Miguel, 2009).

2.6.1 Informal sector solutions

When the government and the formal companies cannot provide water despite effective demand, community organisations or informal entrepreneurs may step in. The informal sector entrepreneurs can operate in these environments because they have low entry costs, are close to the community and can rely on informal mechanisms of enforcement for their operations. Informal entrepreneurs are normally poor people from the same community that they serve. They operate on a small scale, with minimum investments in fixed capital, which minimises the risks of operating in uncertain environments. Because they have a close knowledge of their customers (and because they are not concerned with official regulations) they can tailor their services to the exact needs of the community, including aspects such as the working hours or payment methods. They operate entirely in an informal

environment, where customers, providers and the community follow informal mechanisms of accountability, so they are not affected by ineffectual formal enforcement mechanisms. In many slums and peri-urban areas across Asia, informal entrepreneurs transport water in trucks and sell it to households without pipe connections (Miguel, 2009).

However, the provision of water and other services through the informal sector has important limitations:

- Some services are simply out of reach of the informal sector with its little capital and low technology. This is the case of large-scale waste water treatment. In most other cases, quality is invariably lower than what the formal sector can offer. In The Philippines, informal water providers reach 50% of households but their services are inconsistent and many of them do not survive a change in management.
- Even when the informal sector is able to deliver a service, it may charge higher prices than formal companies do. This is because its low fixed costs often translate into higher marginal costs. The clearest example of this is the provision of water through trucks, rather than through pipes, which requires a modest initial investment but has higher operating costs.
- Because informal entrepreneurs operate like any other business, they will underprovide services that benefit the general public more than the individual customers, such as waste water treatment. Community organisations can provide some public sector perspective within the informal sector, but sometimes their area of interest is too narrow for certain problems that need a broader view.

Because the informal sector is by definition unregulated, sometimes it may be also unreliable and unaccountable to its customers, who lack any formal route of complaining. Users can be empowered through various means to prevent this, but in some cases, only the introduction of formal procedures can prevent abuses (Miguel, 2009).

The limitations of the informal sector should not be an excuse to restrict its ability to operate. Instead, formal private companies and public organisations can replicate some of the strategies and practices that community organisations or informal entrepreneurs follow to reach the poorest customers (Miguel, 2009).

2.7 Creating pro-poor PPP's and their policy implications

Several experiences exist of PPPs that have combined the capital, technology and managerial capacity of informal companies with the informal sector's ability to reach the poorest customers.

We can call them pro-poor because they target the poor, with specific mechanisms to deliver water and other basic services to them and because poor people are included in the design and management of the operations. Another important feature is that they are partnerships that go beyond an agreement between a private company and a government agency, including as well as NGOs, community organisations and even informal entrepreneurs.

The following sections will look at the roles of government, private companies and civil society organisations in these partnerships, and suggest policy implications to improve the role of the Government and encourage the participation of the private sector (Miguel, 2009).

2.8 Role of government agencies

The function of the public sector partner in a PPP is to look at the broader interest of the community and defend the long-term public interest, including environmental concerns and equal access to the service. In pro-poor PPPs a community organisation or a NGO can be the public partner or perform some of the roles traditionally played by Government agencies. Community organisations that engage in these partnerships often benefit from them as an empowering experience that builds up their profile and capacity to engage in other activities. A case study of a water service in Yogyakarta (Indonesia) revealed how the community organisation was empowered by its success and has expanded its reach in neighbouring communities and develop plans for other unrelated services (Miguel, 2009).

It is almost always the case that some government agency, at either national or local level, will be involved in the partnership. Most interventions require administrative permits from central or local governments, although many operate with informal or tacit agreements only, such as Community Sanitation Centres. In many cases the local governments provide land for the operations, but the two most important roles for government agencies are as regulators and providers of subsidies (Miguel,2009).

According to the then ANC spokesperson Jesse Duarte (Pretoria News, 17 September 2009, p.16), there had been protests in 'only' 14 of the 283 municipalities, although other sources put the figure at more than twenty. The strike during the week of 17 September, 2009 by municipal workers raised fears that dissatisfaction with municipal service delivery might further increase and that this might see a spread in protest action. Many of these protests have turned violent and there are indications that criminals are exploiting the situation. Incidents of apparent xenophobia were also reported. Groups of foreigners, fearing the kind of attacks that saw 60 foreigners killed in 2008, were again seeking shelter at police stations. In a number of places, the police had to use force to stabilise the situation and to restore order. Police action included arrests for looting, public violence and various other crimes.

Many reasons for these protests are offered. The primary reason, it would appear, is dissatisfaction with the delivery of basic municipal services such as running water, electricity and toilets, especially in informal settlements. Unemployment (officially at around 23%), high levels of poverty, poor infrastructure, and the lack of houses add to the growing dissatisfaction in these and other poor communities. This comes in the wake of political promises during the election period that all or most of these issues would be addressed once the new government was in place. According to some protesters, this has been a recurring theme in every election since 1994. To some extent, this claim is supported by Roux (2005) who reminds us that the 2004 elections were followed by similar demonstrations in 21 local communities in different parts of the country and for precisely the same reasons. In this regard it is perhaps also worth considering the fact that the South African elections normally take place in the April/May period, immediately before winter when its harsh realities exacerbate the absence of life's immediate necessities (Burger, 2009).

A number of other reasons for the causes of public protests have also been provided. These include allegations of rampant corruption and nepotism within local government structures. Some protesters blame poor service delivery on the deployment of ANC 'comrades' to positions for which they are not qualified. The Minister for Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Sicelo Shiceka, speaking to the South African Local Government Association in East London on Wednesday, 22 April 2009, admitted that, 'many of our Municipalities are in a state of paralysis and dysfunction'. According to the Minister, local government is perceived to be incompetent, disorganised, and 'riddled with corruption and maladministration'. He indicated that, if what they found in North West Province is indicative of the state of municipalities elsewhere in the country, there might be a need to declare a 'national state of emergency' in local government (Burger, 2009).

It is necessary, at this stage, to consider the nature and implications of these service delivery protests against allegations of third force involvement and concerns over its revolutionary potential. So far, no evidence of a third force could be produced, but it may still be useful to consider the revolutionary potential of widespread public discontent and violent acts of protest (Burger, 2010). James Davies, an American sociologist, in a 1962 article 'Towards a Theory of Revolution', theorised about rising expectations and the likelihood of armed conflict. His theory became known as the Davies J-curve, a model that attempts to explain the position where the pace of an individual's reality is not in keeping with his/her expectations about how much better off he/she should be. Normally, the individual's attention is not so bad that it leads either to conflict or to frustration, but when there is a sudden downturn (e.g. in the economy) a major gap is created between expectations and reality, resulting in frustration and discontent. According to Davies' theory of relative deprivation, these frustrated expectations are a cause of social unrest and increase the potential for political unrest. It also helps to overcome the collective action problem, which may breed revolt. 'Revolt' is defined as an attempt to fundamentally change an organisational structure in a relatively short period.

Other sociologists such as Ted Gurr agree that the primary cause for revolution is widespread frustration with the socio-political situation in a particular country. In his book titled, "Why men rebel", published in 1970, Gurr supports the 'frustration-

aggression' theory that explains the violence often accompanying the expression of frustration. The more intense and prolonged the frustration, the greater the probability of aggression. He also argues that the intensity and scope of relative deprivation determines the potential for collective violence and concludes that frustration-aggression is the primary source of the human capacity for violence' (Burger, 2010).

Burger (2010) indicated that it would probably be accurate to describe the fairly limited scope of current service delivery protests in South Africa as symptoms only of socio-political instability. He concluded that if this situation is allowed to continue over a prolonged period, it has the potential to spread and develop into a fully-fledged revolt. "Therefore, although it is important for the police to maintain order and to enforce the law, the solution to the problem does not lie in policing but much rather in speedy solutions to the socio-economic conditions that prevail in many communities. Urgent interventions in relation to the conditions that bedevil the efficient and effective functioning and service delivery of municipalities are crucial. Finally, politicians – especially those who are fairly certain that they will be appointed to government positions after elections – need to take much more responsibility for the promises they make and the expectations they create (Burger, 2010).

There is a high degree of similarity even in the words used in the definition of the IDP in the 2006/07 South Africa Yearbook and IDP skills programme learner guide. The IDP is defined as a "process by which municipalities prepare five year strategic plans that are revised annually in consultation with communities and stakeholders" (Burger, 2010).

The IDP is described in the Municipal Systems Act, 2000 as a single inclusive plan for a municipality that links, integrates and coordinates service delivery, forms the basis for the annual budget, and is adopted by the municipal council as a principal strategic instrument. The main reasons why municipalities formulate IDPs is to ensure that there is integrated service delivery and development goals in municipal areas are achieved in an effective and sustainable way by balancing social, economic and ecological pillars of sustainability without compromising the institutional capacity for implementation of development programmes and projects.

The principles that the IDP should comply with in terms of its formulation are prescribed in the Municipal Systems Act, 2000, Government Regulations, and are explained in a plethora of official literature developed largely by the Department of Provincial and Local Government. Section 6 of the Municipal Systems Act, 2006, prescribes that the IDP should reflect the following:

- The municipal vision for the long-term development of the municipality's most critical development and internal transformation needs;
- An assessment of the existing level of development in the municipality, which must include an identification of communities which do not have access to basic municipal services;
- The council's development priorities and objectives for its elected terms, including its local economic development priorities and objectives for its elected terms, including its local economic development aims and internal transformation needs;
- The council's development strategies, which must be aligned with National or provincial sectional plans and planning requirements binding on the municipality in terms of legislation;
- A spatial development framework, which must include the provision of basic guidelines for a land use management system for the municipality;
- The council's operational strategies;
- Applicable disaster management plans;
- A financial plan; and
- The key performance indicators and targets as determined in terms of section 41 of the same Act.

With the IDP, municipalities in the context of the contemporary development trajectory in South Africa and particularly in so far as the country's development legacy of the past is concerned, aim to restructure cities, towns and rural areas, eradicate poverty, create wealth, improve municipal government, consolidate local government transformation, ensure more effective and efficient allocation and utilisation of resources, fast track service delivery, engender the culture of political and administrative accountability, monitor and evaluate municipal performance, and foster cooperative governance (Mello & Maserumule, 2010).

By its nature and in terms of how it should be developed as prescribed in the Municipality Systems Act, 2000, the IDP requires that all the spheres of government should, within the context of the intergovernmental relations systems as explained above, be engaged in municipal planning. This is to maximise the relevance of the National Spatial Development Perspective (NSDP), provincial growth and development strategies (PGDS) and strategic plans of sector developments in the IDP (Mello & Maserumule, 2010).

Ministerial regulations are provided to effect and give meaning to the foregoing component. In essence, specificity of what must be in the IDP is the reason for ministerial regulations. These regulations regarding the implementation of an IDP are meant to supplement the existing municipal regulations on IDP matters to ensure that the municipality's institutional framework is in place and that all possible projects to be implemented are identified, as well as the necessary performance for the implementation and adoption of the IDP. Planning without considering how the plans would be coordinated and implemented is unlikely to yield the desired results. The Municipal Systems Act, 2000 is the salient guideline and yardstick for the implementation of IDPs by municipalities (Phago, 2009).

Two of the key policy frameworks that must be taken into account are what are called assistance to the poor (indigent) and poverty alleviation. The two policies must be entrenched in all municipal processes and ultimately become a corporate responsibility, which must be cascaded into the performance agreements of senior managers (Phago, 2009).

2.9 Service Delivery and the Budget Implementation Plan

Section 1 of the Municipal Financial Management Act, 2003, defines the Service Delivery and Budget Implementation Plan as a detailed plan approved by the mayor of a municipality in terms of Section 53 (1) (c) (ii) for implementing the municipality's service delivery plan and implementing the annual budget, which must include (as part of the top layer) the following:

- Projections for each month of:
- Revenue to be collected by source,

- Operational expenditure by vote;
- Service delivery targets and performance indicators for each quarter.

A service delivery budget implementation plan and a service delivery plan must be responsive to the needs of the ward in which performance in service delivery against end of year targets and implementation the budget are measured. It is my view that ward-based budget allocation will have the following benefits to the municipality:

- If ward councillors must be employed full-time by the council by which their monthly salaries would be determined in terms of revenue collection coming from their respective wards in which they encourage local residents especially those who are able to pay for municipal services.
- Ward committees are the eyes and ears of the council and are where democratic participation takes place through community engagement;
- Ward committees and communities will be encouraged to develop their ward-based plans, which must inform the review process of the IDP, so that a measurable impact on service delivery would be easily noticeable and levels of poor service delivery identified.

Key components of the service delivery and budget implementation plan

A service delivery and budget implementation plan (SDBIP) consists of six components, namely:

- Monthly projections of revenue to be collected measured against the actual revenue collected;
- Monthly projection of expenditure measured in terms of actual expenditure;
- Quarterly programmes of service delivery targets and indicators for each vote;
- Ward information on service delivery and expenditure for example electricity connections (total number);
- Information and progress on the implementation of an IDP can be submitted separately to councillors if not desired to be part of the top layer; and,
- Detailed capital work plans of wards, broken down in terms of ward number, project number, name of project, short description, start date, planned

completion, actual completion date and justification for the project and reasons for variance.

The SDBIP has two layers. The top layer has consolidated service delivery targets and in-year deadlines and is the layer which should be made public. The second layer consists of more detailed information which is linked to the top layer and breaking it down into matters of detail, prepared by business unit managers for their divisions, and which is further broken down into sections and other operational areas (RSA, 2003). The top layer of the service delivery and budget implementation plan, which is tabled in council, should be revised or amended without the council approval. It can be deduced that is limitation services to prevent the business unit managers, municipal manager and executive mayor from changing service delivery targets if they see that these targets may not be reached due to poor performance.

Key Performances Indicators:

- Input indicators will be provided by actual expenditure;
- No managerial objectives should be measured in the service delivery and budget implementation plan;
- Targets with regard to service backlogs should be part of the service delivery and budget implementation plan;
- The service delivery and budget implementation plan has the following indicators:
 - Input indicators (expenditure patterns);
 - Output indicators (e.g. number of new water connections);
 - Outcome indicators (impact) (e.g. number of people with access to water (Vatala, 2005).

2.10 Public participation and the Integrated Development Planning

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 asserts that South Africa is a representative and a participatory democracy. Representative democracy is where people elect representatives to make decisions on their behalf. Municipal councillors are elected directly by residents to represent their interests in the local council. They get a mandate from the voters based on their election manifesto. This is a form of

representative democracy. Participatory democracy is where people make decisions themselves. All the people affected participate in the decision making and there are no representatives who can decide on their behalf. This can work in small communities where everyone can meet to discuss and decide an issue (<http://www.etu.org.za>).

People have the right to participate in the democratic processes of government. The underlying notion is that citizens, both the uneducated and unorganised, as well as the organised and the powerful, should have an on-going say in the decisions that affect their lives, beyond their episodic participation at election time. Hence the challenge is to design and implement processes that permit those voices to be heard and taken seriously, so that public representatives in general and councillors in particular, can take the ever-changing needs and desires of the most widely representative communities into account when making decisions, resolutions and by-laws passed by a municipal council, and overseeing their implementation by the municipal administration (<http://www.etu.org.za>).

2.10.1 Public participation

According to Ababio (2007), participatory democracy means the provision of services based on the existence of a legislative framework that facilitates consultation, involvement and mobilisation of civil society in the formal process of policy making and implementation. Several pieces of legislation require some form of public participation in local government. Key amongst them is the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996. Sections 152 and 195 of the Constitution provide that the municipalities are obliged to encourage the involvement of communities and community organisations in municipal affairs; that people's needs must be responded to; and that the public must be encouraged to participate in policy making.

The White Paper on Local Government, 1998, describes developmental local government as "local government committed to working with citizens and groups within the community to find sustainable ways to meet their social, economic and material needs and improve the quality of their lives". The local government: Municipal Structures Act, 1998, gives metropolitan and local municipalities the option

to establish ward committees as one of the specialised structures to enhance participatory democracy in local government. Municipalities must give effect to the provisions of the Act when establishing ward committees. The municipalities are required to annually report on the involvement of communities and community organisations in the affairs of the municipality. The Act stipulates that a municipality's executive mayor or executive committee has to give an annual report on the extent to which the public had participated in municipal affairs. The Municipal Systems Act, 2000 provides for the legal nature of a municipality as including the local community within the municipal area, working in partnership with the municipality's political and administrative structures to provide for community participation. Municipal System Act of 2000 Chapter 4 of the Act determines that a municipal council must develop a culture of participatory government and must for this purpose encourage and create conditions for residents, communities and other stakeholders in the municipality to participate in local affairs. Ababio (2007) contends that the Municipal Systems Act, 2000 provides the core principles of developmental local government. The Municipal Finance Management Act, 2003 encourages the participation of communities in the finances of municipalities, including the development of municipal budgets. The Municipal Property Rates Act, 2004 stipulates that members of the public must participate in the determination of municipal property rates. Moodley and Govender (2006) argue that municipal property rates also attempts to achieve equity in the local tax regime.

The level of participation – at least through legal channels – is but one indicator of the legitimacy of the South African local government system. As long as people consider it worth their time to participate, they are assumed to have some level of efficacy, and that they still consider the system as legitimate. I argue that the public voice serves as a reminder to leaders at the national, provincial and local spheres of government that the public has not only vested in them the mandate to lead, but also the responsibility to serve the public as well.

The Draft National Policy Framework on Public Participation, 2007 defines public participation as an open, accountable process through which individuals and groups within selected communities can exchange views and influence decision-making processes. It is further defined as a democratic process of engaging people in

deciding, planning and playing an active part in the development and operation of services that affect their lives. From the various definitions, it seems that the definition of community participation is dependent on the context in which it is referred to. Public Participation is a mechanism designed to ensure that government is accountable, open and transparent in the periods between elections. It does this by ensuring that the government engages with the electorate between elections (Midgely, 1986).

Midgely (1986) states that the concepts of community participation that appeal to western educated middle-class activists do not conform to the expectations of ordinary people. For many people, community means sharing the benefits that others in society already enjoy.

In the South African context, participation in municipal affairs takes place in terms of two main objectives. The first relates to upholding the principles and systems of participatory democracy and ensuring the legitimacy of the state in the local sphere through citizens being encouraged to participate in formal political processes such as elections. The second objective relates to local government's development mandate to alleviate poverty through service delivery and localised socio-economic development initiatives. These two objectives enable one to define participation cautiously as an inclusive process aimed at deepening democracy through formal participatory mechanisms and alleviating poverty through localised socio-economic development initiatives and improved basic service delivery (Ababio, 2006).

Ababio (2006: 615) argues that the South African government has committed itself to instituting wide ranging participatory processes in the different spheres and institutions of government in the country. This indicates that public participation is a principle that is applicable to all spheres of government in South Africa. Participation is important to make sure that government addresses the real needs of communities in the most appropriate way. Participation also contributes to building an informed and responsible citizenry with a sense of ownership of government developments and projects. It allows municipalities to get support from private and to develop partnerships with stakeholders. Participation is one of the cornerstones of democracy and has equal benefits for politicians, officials and civil society.

Consultation will assist councils to make more appropriate decisions based on the real needs of people. The more informed people are, the better they will understand what goals government is endeavouring to achieve and what the budget and resource limitations with the people they represent and if they consult and report back on key council decisions. Government cannot address all the development needs on its own and partnerships are needed with communities, civil society and business to improve service delivery and development (Ababio, 2006).

2.10.2 Facilitation of Community Participation in Municipal Process

Various public participation programmes and structures exist, such as IDP Representative Forum Meetings, Community and Ward-based Planning Forums, Ward Committees, IDP/Budget Imbizos and other participation forums. Facilitation of participation simply means municipalities must create opportunities and empower the poor to access these opportunities even including assisting poor and marginalised people to form organisations that will advance their interests. Public participation as a matter of fact, always benefits those being consulted, affords the opportunity to obtain valuable inputs, reduces perceived hostility and consultation fatigue or the notion of participation as an exercise in stakeholder liaison (Asmah-Andoh, 2009).

Public participation processes should place greater emphasis on outcomes of participation and planning rather than processes, and on actual delivery and people's experiences rather than organisation. The quality of political and administrative responsiveness and accountability needs to be improved as part of the methodology for dealing with the impoverished and marginalised members of community (Asmah-Andoh, 2009).

Implementation of policies and facilitation of services delivery through the processes of integrated development planning provide the basis for accountability and compliance by municipalities. The adequacy and extent of these processes for meaningful and sustainable participation for the poor and often neglected members of the community are matters that remain untested. At the same time, it appears to have unintended in-built inflexibility for inter-local collaborative service delivery, especially where grouping of areas into one metro or district municipality were thought to be difficult to implement (Asmah-Andoh, 2009)

Poverty and inequality have spatial dimensions which can be exacerbated by lack of resources and poverty gaps in fragmented municipal institutions. A case can therefore be made for municipalities to operate in a more flexible manner through voluntary adjacent inter-municipal collaboration for service delivery outside their respective demarcated jurisdictions. Municipalities have to utilise the process of integrated planning and local economic development to facilitate better participation of the poor and marginalised through the creation of specific and appropriate local government institutions on which the poor and marginalised depend. The programmes and strategies of the anti-poverty strategies for South Africa are intended to alleviate poverty and inequality in communities in South Africa. The role of the local sphere of government is to deliver services in addition to national and provincial income support to reduce poverty and inequality in all South African community (Asmah-Andoh, 2009).

2.10.3 Constraints in Public Participation

The general constraints related to public participation in South Africa cannot be ignored. Most, if not all, municipalities have challenges pertaining to the vast distances that have to be travelled due to the size of municipal areas. People are experiencing participation fatigue as they are tired of participating in their own development without seeing the meaningful benefits of their participation (Mafunisa & Xaba, 2008).

According to Mafunisa and Xaba (2008), there are misgivings with regard to the way the IDP process is managed, for example, bureaucratic red-tape and under-resourcing of the IDP participation structures, the municipality's inability to ensure the participation of the business sector in the IDP meetings at the local sphere. The IDP representative's structures appear inappropriate as mechanisms to ensure the participation of the business sector, there is lack of special efforts to ensure the participation of the non-organised, marginalised sections of the provincial inhabitants and groups in the IDP process. From the above exposition, it can be argued that creative ways should be formed to address these constraints. This will automatically improve the quality of public participation in the IDP process in the provinces (Mafunisa & Xaba, 2008).

CHAPTER 3

3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.0 Introduction

This chapter introduces the site of study in this research, the Emfuleni Local Municipality. It discusses the population of the Municipality, its total work force, and, most importantly, it indicates the sample size and selected methods used in data collection. The chapter also explains how the data was analysed and outlines some ethical considerations of the research.

3.1 Study Area

The Emfuleni Local Municipality is one of three Local Municipalities comprising the Sedibeng District Municipality. It is the Western-most local municipality of the district, which covers the entire southern area of the Gauteng province, extending along a 120 kilometre axis from east to west. It covers an area of 987.45 km². The Vaal River forms part of the southern boundary of the Municipality. Emfuleni shares boundaries with the Metsimaholo Local Municipality in the Free State to the south, the Midvaal Local Municipality to the east, the City of Johannesburg Metropolitan area to the North and the Westonaria and Potchefstroom Local Municipalities (in the North West Province) to the west. The Municipality is strategically located, with access to a well maintained road network, including the N1 national route linking Johannesburg and Bloemfontein, which traverses Emfuleni. Within the area, the municipality has two main town centres, namely, Vereeniging and Vanderbijlpark, and Sasolburg is only 10 km to the south, across the provincial boundary. It forms part of the “heartland” of what was formerly known as the Vaal Triangle, renowned for its contribution to the iron and steel industry in South Africa. Emfuleni also contains approximately the six large peri-urban townships of Evaton, Sebokeng, Sharpeville, Boipatong, Bophelong and Tshepiso. The other approximately ten smaller settlements tend to be suburban settlements within six kilometres of the above towns, and these are Bonanne, Steelpark, Duncanville, Unitaspark, Sonlandpark, Waldrift, Rust-ter-Vaal, Roshnee and Debonair Park (Emfuleni Local Municipality IDP, 2009-2010).

3.2 Population

The current population of the Emfuleni Local Municipality is estimated at 658 422 (Stats SA, 2001). Emfuleni is a largely urbanised municipality. The Emfuleni Local Municipality has approximately 4 500 employees. Geographically, most of the African population is concentrated in areas such as Sebokeng, Evaton, Sharpeville, Boipatong, Bophelong and Tshepiso.

3.3 Sample Size and Selection Method

The sample size of this evaluation has been drawn from municipal officials, the IDP Office, the Municipal Manager, the Engineering departments (which include the Roads, Water, Sanitation, Electricity and Housing departments), Ward Councillors, chairpersons of various political parties, organised and unorganised business structures and ordinary members of the community.

Purposive sampling was used in this study. The sample consisted of approximately 100 people who reside within the Emfuleni Local Municipality. Of these, 20 were officials, 20 were councillors, 20 chairpersons of political parties in various wards, 20 represented organised and unorganised business structures and the last 20 were ordinary citizens of the community.

The rationality behind choosing 100 people to be interviewed was the need to get fair representations and involvement of all stakeholders who reside within the jurisdiction of the Emfuleni Municipal area. The study is about an evaluation of the effectiveness of the IDP in service delivery. In this case, officials are responsible for the development, review and implementation of the IDP. This therefore necessitated having officials as part of the study sample in order to get their viewpoints. Councillors are the voice of the community, they are the mediators between the municipality and the local community, hence there is a need to have them as part of the sample for the study. The community, on the other hand, is incomplete without the business fraternity. The needs of the Councillors and ordinary members of the community might vary as well. Chairpersons of various political parties were also involved to avoid bias towards the political party in power and also get the point of view of other political parties not represented in the council sittings. Even though

ordinary citizens are represented by Councillors, the study wants to establish whether or not their issues are well represented by their elected Councillors.

3.4 Data Collection Methods

In this investigation, a qualitative research method was used for data collection. Unstructured face-to-face interviews were conducted, as they have the advantage of soliciting or probing for more information. Personal observation was used in assessing the situation; and memoranda presented during service delivery protests were also collected and analysed. This investigation will not yield results that can be generalised to all municipalities based on Emfuleni outcomes, because this study is qualitative and does not seek generalisation. Data was also collected using focus group discussions to see areas of common understanding among the respondents.

3.5 Data Analysis

The most common analysis of qualitative data is observer impressions. That is, expert or bystander observers examine the data, interpret it by forming an impression and report their impressions in a structured form. Interviews were conducted with the municipal officials, whereas semi- and unstructured, open-ended questionnaires were presented to ward councillors, PR councillors, chairpersons of various political parties (both structured and unstructured), and semi-structured questionnaires to business formations and ordinary members of the community, so as to get a deeper understanding of their experiences, which structured instruments may not allow. A thematic approach was used, in which data was categorised, based on themes.

3.6 Ethical Considerations

Before they became subjects of research, all participants were notified of:

- The aims, methods, anticipated benefits and potential hazards of the research;
- Their right to abstain from participation in the research and to withhold a response at any time;
- The confidential nature of their replies;

- No pressure or inducement of any kind was applied to encourage an individual to become a subject of research.
- Privacy;
- No harm;
- Anonymity was also ensured, so that no third party will be privy to the raw data without the respondents' consent and that no harm would befall the respondents by being involved in this study.

CHAPTER 4

4. Presentation and Interpretation of Results

4.0 Introduction

This chapter presents an analysis, interpretations of the findings and a discussion of the data collected with regard to an evaluation of the effectiveness of the Integrated Development Plan on service delivery with reference to the Emfuleni Local Municipality in Gauteng. The data was collected by means of questionnaires, semi-structured interviews and, in some instances, observations. The questionnaires as well as the interviews were conducted as stated in the previous chapter. The targeted groups were Municipal officials, Councillors, Business fraternity, Chairpersons of various political parties and Emfuleni municipal community at large.

This report therefore outlines the recorded viewpoints of each category of respondent mentioned above.

4.1 Community participation process in the IDP process

In evaluating the IDP community participation process, a number of comments need to be made in respect of the interviews that were conducted. The community participation process that was done by the Emfuleni Municipality was executed in two ways, according to the municipal officials in the IDP office. Firstly, between 2001 and 2004, public participation was done through consultancy in the form of IDP representative forums. Subsequently, public participation meetings were conducted by Emfuleni Local Municipality officials in consultation with councillors. According to the key IDP informant in the Emfuleni Local Municipality, the public participation meetings were held as follows:

The first meetings were consultant-driven and people did not differentiate the two spheres of government and their powers and functions. To the community, the roles of the District and Emfuleni Local Municipality appear as one and the same thing. Participation took place through organised structures. The level of participation was limited to information sharing and consultation. This was evidenced when the

councillors and officials confirmed that most decisions were taken by the IDP Steering Committee (consisting mainly of officials) since the councillors were not actively involved, even though they were members. The public participation meetings were therefore used for information sharing purposes. Such an approach surely hampers the achievement of the goal of ensuring empowerment of people as well as project efficiency. The community was not involved in decision making through the setting of indicators and targets for the objectives development, nor by the identification of outputs and activities, as per the performance regulation and the IDP guide pack.

The main question in relation to the situation outlined above is, who were the stakeholders during the IDP process and what are the priorities of the Emfuleni Local Municipality? It becomes evident that community participation is after all, merely regarded as a necessity required by legislation or the IDP guide pack but is not considered to be of significance for development, or it is also possible that sufficient resources are not available in this regard.

The following table summarised the community participation process between 2001 and May 2004 according to the Emfuleni IDP office.

Table 1: Community participation process, 2001-2004

Characteristics	Emfuleni Local Municipality
Method of participation	Representative forum
Stakeholders actively involved	Councillors, sector departments
Level of participation	Information sharing
IDP document availed to the community	No slide presentations

The above table indicates that the method of participation for IDP process used in the Emfuleni Local Municipality was in the form of an IDP Representative Forum, the

stakeholders actively involved during the process were Councillors and sector departments, the level of participation was in the form of sharing of information rather than getting fresh ideas from the participants and lastly, the table reveals that the IDP document was distributed to the participants.

The IDP public participation process was therefore changed in September 2004. The Municipality appointed an IDP Manager to drive the IDP process. The meetings were therefore classified according to regions, and marginalised groups were also met separately from other stakeholders. The Emfuleni Local Municipality has for the first time established its own public participation in the IDP process separate from the Sedibeng District Municipality. The public participation structures were then reviewed. The new structure was as follows: public participation meetings were held as per region. The area was then divided into four regions and split again according to wards. Public participation was therefore ward-based, as shown in table 2 below.

Table 2: Emfuleni Regional structure

Region	Wards/Sector
Region 1	18, 19, 20, 24, 26, 29, 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, & 43
Region 2	3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 23 & 25
Region 3	1, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 21 & 22
Region 4	2, 17, 27, 28, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35 & 36
Business Breakfast	Business people, NGOs, sector departments, ELM senior officials and mayoral committee

Table 2 shows the classification of the Emfuleni Local Municipal ward structure during IDP public participation meetings. The Emfuleni Local Municipality consist of 43 wards. The wards are clustered or grouped per region during public participation. Region 1 consists of 13 wards, region 2 of 10 wards, region 3 of 9 wards and region 4 of 11 wards. Lastly, there was the business breakfast attended by business people, NGOs, sector departments, ELM senior officials and the mayoral committee.

According to my observation, the designated groups or marginalised groups were also met on their own. These include women, people living with disability, youth and children. The ward-based type of meetings mostly target the ordinary members of the community. This type of participation seems to have slightly improved from the time the municipality was using consultants to drive the IDP review process and public participation meetings. The Speaker of the Council chairs all public meetings and the Executive Mayor talks to the community in all regions and all organised stakeholders.

My observation also revealed that despite the appointment of the IDP Manager by the Emfuleni Local Municipality to drive the IDP process, the level of engagement with the community has still not yet improved, based on interviews with members of the community. It became very clear that public participation is not effective. The Executive Mayor will present the projects anticipated for the following year and community will be given an opportunity to raise their concerns or inputs and comments thereafter. The Executive Mayor may talk for more than one and a half hours (90 minutes) but the community is only given less than thirty minutes to raise their concerns. Despite community dissatisfaction with the Municipal plan or IDP, their inputs are not taken into consideration. The plan will be implemented without taking into consideration the inputs of the community. This simply means that the Emfuleni Local Municipality IDP does not address the issues that are affecting the community or is failing to comply with the Municipal Systems Act no, 32 of 2000. The Act requires that the IDP should be informed by the needs of the community.

Community participation only takes place twice a year, generally close to the time that the IDP is approved, around March and September each year. According to a performance management specialist, there seems to be a gap for the municipality to have regular meetings with its community to update them with regard to the implementation of the IDP and service delivery and budget implementation plan. The most worrying factor in the whole process is that the community is not involved during various planning phases prior to the implementation of the IDP. The projects are mostly determined by the line managers without the involvement of the community.

4.2 Understanding the concept of the Integrated Development Plan (IDP)

4.2.1 Perspective of officials

From the twenty municipal officials that were interviewed, it became very clear that the concept of the IDP is a known concept in the municipality. All officials who were interviewed, from the Municipal Manager to the Engineering Department, Human Resources, IDP office, finance and political offices and so on know about the IDP. There is the clear understanding of an IDP as a municipality's five year strategic plan that drives service delivery and informs budgeting processes. According to a respondent from the Human Resources Department, it was indicated that most of the officials other than the IDP departments have undergone training in IDP processes and have a clear understanding of the concept.

Besides the IDP department within the Emfuleni Local Municipality, all other departments such as Roads and Storm Water, Water and Sanitation, Waste Management, Finance and the political offices acknowledged that the manner in which IDP review process is being conducted leaves much to be desired. They voiced their frustration at the unrealistic time-frames given to submit the requested information to the IDP office, which ultimately informs the IDP document of the next financial year. One of the managers had this to say:

The process does compromise the end result, which is the IDP document, which is not reliable and credible and of course this also creates a wrong image of the municipality.

During a focus group with managers of ELM from the Departments of Roads and Storm Water, Electricity, Water and Sanitation, Housing, Budget, Internal Audit, Waste Management, it became clear that IDP does indeed create immense expectations within the community and this is reinforced by the way in which the municipality conducts its public participation. Great expectations arise during public participation meetings and from the political statements uttered during those meetings, without necessarily verifying the municipal budget and IDP plans for those areas.

The followings have been identified as challenges in terms of the IDP according to one of the managers:

- There are too many projects to be implemented within a very short space of time. Emfuleni's IDPs in the past 10 years have identified more than 100 projects to be implemented within 12 months. Despite failure to implement all those projects for the particular year, the municipality continues to increase the number of projects to be implemented each year.
- Targets set by National and Provincial government are not realistic. The local municipality is an implementing agency for national and provincial plans and strategies, However, some of the targets set at the national level do not consider the resources at the disposal of the local government. The resources can be either in the form of human resources and inputs such as finance. Some of the national government's targets are, for example, to halve the unemployment level by 2014, and the tarring of all gravel road by 2014. The resources at local level do not match the targets set at national and provincial levels. The Municipality does not have enough cash, and as a result, it is impossible to meet targets and key performance indicators as set by both national and provincial governments.

4.2.1.1 Unfunded mandate from national and provincial departments

According to one of the managers during an interview, the national and provincial governments have to transfer some of their mandate or responsibility to local municipalities, nation-wide. The typical example is primary health. The transfer of such responsibility to local municipality does not consider the capacity and financial constraints at the local level. This, in turn, has affected the implementation and execution of the integrated development plan.

4.2.1.2 Financial constraints

During the focus group discussions with municipal officials, it emerged that the needs are far greater than the available resources. There is internal acknowledgement by the Emfuleni Local Municipality's officials that IDPs contain all

the needs of the community but the challenge remains at the implementation of identified needs due to financial constraints.

Furthermore, the way in which the budget is compiled, always estimates or anticipates a higher collection rate than what the municipality can achieve. This has resulted in the yearly budget being adjusted downwards and has ultimately meant the cutting of both operational and capital budgets. This, of course, has a negative impact on the implementation of the Council's Integrated Development Plan.

According to officials from the Roads Department, the departmental budget was supposed to be increased annually in order for the department to meet some of the set targets, but instead, the budget is being reduced year after year. In 2008/09 the total budget was R 168 million and in 2009/10 it was reduced to R 150 million. The backlog is increasing immensely at the same time that the budget to address the backlog is being reduced.

Participants also revealed a number of financial constraints and problems limiting effective and efficient service delivery throughout the ELM, including administrative and bureaucratic difficulties in the accessing, application and implementation of the indigent policy system for free electricity, water and sanitation in all areas in a uniform manner.

In the focus group discussions with the business fraternity, participants also raised the problem of delays in payment after services have been rendered. They indicated that according to the ELM's supply chain management policy, service providers should be paid within 30 days of receipt of the invoice, but the ELM does not live up to its policy.

According to one of the participants from the business fraternity, business people in the Emfuleni Local Municipality area have no knowledge of whether or not the Emfuleni IDP has identified the needs of the community. The excerpt below encapsulates his sentiments of being sidelined:

We, as business people in the Vaal, are only interested in getting jobs and tenders, not IDP or community needs. But the Emfuleni Local Municipality has a tendency of giving business to the outsiders, people who do not reside within the jurisdiction of the municipality.

4.2.1.3 Collection rate

According to respondents in this study, the municipality renders basic services such as water, electricity, refuse removal and others to the community. Despite this, the council does not collect enough rates and taxes to meet its service delivery obligations as reflected in the IDP. This has rendered the Emfuleni Local Municipality IDP merely a wish list.

In the focus group with managers, it was reported that government funding is based on a backlog that is outdated. The statistical data collected in 2001 by Statistics South Africa is still the primary source used by municipalities for planning purposes as well as allocations of resources by the National Treasury. National government does not accept any data except those from Stats SA. This has contributed immensely to the financial constraints at municipal area level.

4.2.2 Perspective of Councillors

The councillors also echoed the same sentiments as officials. The interview was conducted with both PR Councillors and ward councillors. All twenty councillors that were interviewed clearly understood the concept of the IDP, Council priorities and the process as a whole. Ward Councillors also alluded to the fact that communities are engaged in the IDP process but that the challenge lies in the manner in which the public participation process is handled. For instance, they echoed their frustration about the manner in which senior politicians take the community for granted. They indicated that year in and year out there is no visible service delivery at a local level.

In an interview with one of the longest serving councillors, it was noted that in the 2003/4 financial year the Municipality had a serious financial crisis and at the time it was understandable why there was no visible service delivery. But, in the last two financial years, the municipal financial status had improved drastically from R1.2 to R3.5 billion per annum. The councillor indicated that despite the improvement in financial status, service delivery is not satisfactory. She indicated that the IDP ought to influence the process of service delivery but this is not really the case at Emfuleni. She acknowledge that the IDP indeed highlights the priorities of the council, projects to be executed each financial year and the three-year capital budget as well as the

areas that need urgent or immediate attention, but what nullifies the process is the poor implementation of identified projects.

4.2.3 Perspective of members of the community

The IDP is a strategic planning tool that seeks to identify and address the needs of the local community in the Emfuleni Local Municipality. There are contradictory views about its IDP. According to a member of the Sharpeville concerned residents, the needs of the community were not incorporated into the Municipal Integrated Development Plan. He stated that the Municipality is very good at raising the expectations of the community without necessarily delivering on their promises. Ward and PR councillors have different perspectives from members of the public and officials. Their view is that the IDP is not static and that it changes year after year without addressing issues that have been raised by the community during public participation. They argue that the 2005/6 IDP was very comprehensive and identified almost all the needs of the community, but that the only challenge was with the implementation of the identified projects and the intentional omission or removal of the needs of the community during the review of the IDP each year, resulting in them not being implemented.

4.3 Service delivery challenges at the municipal level

The officials perceive the so called “service delivery protests” as nothing other than internal political factions, whereas members of the community who were interviewed see municipal officials as lazy, corrupt and careless of their needs. A business Chamber of Commerce member was more concerned about enhancement of the local economy from awarding tenders to local business people than with service delivery.

According to Councillors, service delivery protests are motivated by those who did not make it as either PR or ward councillors. They see it as a clear campaign to topple ward councillors. This, therefore, paints a negative picture of the state of service delivery.

In an interview, a senior municipal official claimed: “The public uses service delivery protests as a scapegoat, whereas they have their own hidden agenda with people in leadership”. However, some officials and Councillors, have indeed acknowledged that in some instances there are genuine service delivery protests.

In a recent public participation meeting held in Sebokeng Township on the 16 March, 2011, it became evident that Councillors and senior municipal officials make promises that are not contained in the Integrated Development Plan and not budgeted for. These are some of the issues that raise immense expectations from the community. When the municipality fails to deliver on its promises, this usually results in service delivery protests. The research also established that members of the community need to be educated about the importance of paying for municipal services. The level of payment of rates and taxes is minimal, but the service delivery expectation is very high.

The Department of Roads and Storm Water and others have acknowledged receiving petitions from the broader community regarding service delivery challenges and as well as about the bad state of roads across the municipal area. The turnaround time is about three to four weeks due to human resources constraints. The following are the common complaints received by the Roads and Storm Water Department: gravel roads to be graded, dangerous open storm water channels, potholes and road markings, people living with disability not considered when constructing roads, and gravel roads to be graded, are commonly reported in Sebokeng, Evaton and Ward 25. Complaints about patching of tarred roads mostly come from Roshnee, Vanderbijlpark and Vereeniging. The community considers the local clinic to be too small; lack of drugs in clinic; lack of health facilities; lack of a mobile clinic; lack of recreational facilities; grading of soccer field; lack of sports facilities in Evaton; no recreational facilities including community hall; lack of sports facilities and lack of a community hall. Residents are not happy about water leakages, bursting of old pipes, there is a need for basic water supply to the indigent, and the community wants the municipality to develop the wetland into a park, from Frikkie Meyer to Lebogang High School.

The residents also complain about the following: lack of a youth development strategy; one-stop service centre needed; theft of copper; poor quality of supply; lack of skills development centres; lack of housing; illegal extension of houses; housing backlogs; more RDP/backyard rooms required; water-logged houses in extensions 11 and 14; poor living conditions in hostels; mushrooming of illegal informal settlements; need for housing in Kanana; outstanding 68 houses to relocate people from wetlands; and maintenance of low-cost housing in CW5. The residents also complain about Illegal dumping, noise and air pollution caused by Arcelor Mittal, and inconsistent refuse removal (see figure 1 below)



Figure 1. Illegal dumping in Tshepiso

Dissatisfaction arises from sewer spillages and blockages, street lights and high-mast lights not working, inconsistent traffic lights, continuous power cuts and unmaintained electrical infrastructures, the high rate of crime and limited police stations across the municipal area. Regarding finance, residents complain about incorrect billing, poor customer services and not enough pay points.

The challenges identified by ELM officials and councillors in the research questionnaires are similar to those outlined by the community at large, and centred on:

- Poor quality of work undertaken by contractors responsible for the construction of new facilities and/or maintenance and repair of existing facilities, most noticeable in the structural defects evident in recently constructed houses, deviation from agreed specifications and design flaws seen in a number of housing projects across the ELM, as well with respect to children's playground equipment. Low quality of workmanship was also noted in relation to the potholes that have yet to be fixed and roads that had only been partially gravelled.
- Delays, blockages in the completion and/or abandonment of projects as a result of contractual, financial, design, capacity and human resource problems on the part of contractors and service providers. These obstacles need to be overcome to ensure efficient and effective service delivery that meets the needs of all members of the Emfuleni Local Municipality.

4.4 State of roads in the Emfuleni Local Municipality

According to a respondent in the Roads and Storm Water Department, the state of service delivery in the ELM is very bad. The condition of roads and storm water drains are deteriorating at a very high rate. Council needs to concentrate on service delivery matters rather than filling vacancies that do not add value in terms of service delivery. He noted that the council's budget is increasing immensely without improvement in service delivery. The council neglects service delivery matters while sponsoring external events. Service delivery is affected due to the appointment of contractors that are a risk to the Municipality. Senior Management changes the tender evaluation technical reports and appoints people who have been rated lower according to the report. The average length of roads tarred in a year is approximately 11 kilometres. One thousand three hundred (1 300) kilometres of roads are still gravel, and this means that the target set by the Gauteng Province to tar all gravel roads by 2014 will not be achieved or seems unrealistic. The backlog of one

thousand four hundred and sixteen (1 416) kilometres of tarred roads is simply too high compared to the yearly achievements.

According to a respondent in Roads and Storm Water Department, maintenance of tarred roads is done between three to five years after construction. Street sweeping is supposed to be done six times a year, but the Emfuleni Local Municipality does it once or twice a year due to human resource constraints. Gravel roads are graded once in 10 years, but the norm should be every two to three years. Re-gravelling should be done after 10 to 15 years.

Participants pointed out that the challenges posed by low quality, narrow, untarred access and internal roads, full of potholes and cracks and without speed humps, for emergency services, police, refuse collection and funeral processions were particularly severe, as was the issue of safety on these roads. The limited provision of pedestrian and/or motor vehicle bridges connecting communities to other parts of the township was also a problem.(See figures 2, 3 and 4 below)



Figure 2. Potholes in Sharpeville



ERROR: ioerror
OFFENDING COMMAND: image

STACK: