COMPARATIVE STUDY OF A DISMISSAL ON ACCOUNT OF
OPERATIONAL REQUIREMENTS BETWEEN SOUTH AFRICAN AND
GERMAN LABOUR LAW

By: JACK MALESELA LEDWABA
B. JURIS (UNIN), LLB (UNIN), DIP IN DRAFTING AND INTERPRETATION OF
CONTRACT(UJ), DIP IN LEGISLATIVE DRAFTING (VISTA)

Advocate of the High Court of South Africa.

DISSERTATION – ML70DIS

Submitted in part fulfilment of the requirements for

MASTER OF LAWS DEGREE

(LLM – Labour Law)

DEPARTMENT OF MERCANTILE LAW
FACULTY OF MANAGEMENT SCIENCES AND LAW

UNIVERSITY OF LIMPOPO
(SCHOOL OF LAW)
Private Bag 1106
SOVenga
0727

REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: MR M.C. LEBEA
BProc, LLB (UNIN), Dipl Corporate Law (Cum Laude)(RAU),
LLM LABOUR LAW (CORNELI UNV)
Preface

Thanks expressed in this work to many people who have contributed directly and indirectly to this work, either by unintended inspiration or by helpful comments and assistance, are extended. I wish in particular to record my indebtedness to the General Manager for Legal Services of the Office of the Premier Adv. P C Rammutla with whom I work, and to the fellow students, and colleagues whose insights are reflected in these pages. A dissertation of this nature cannot be produced without the dedication of people whose contribution would not be recognized without acknowledgment. These people include Mr M C Lebea, my supervisor, whose careful proof reading will hopefully have assisted in removing those annoying typographical and stylistic errors that managed to slip uncorrected from one earlier draft to this one. Finally, I wish once again to thank my personal assistant and a fellow colleague, Ella Nkoana without whose unfailing help and support in this and other endeavours the completion of this dissertation would not have been possible. To her, once again and to my domestic worker Ms Tlou Francina Marwala, this dissertation is dedicated, with deep sense of appreciation.

Advocate Jack Malesela Ledwaba
Author

University of Limpopo
2008
DECLARATION

I declare that the dissertation hereby submitted to the University of Limpopo for the degree of Master of Laws has not been previously submitted by me for the degree at this or any other University; that it is my own work in design and in execution; and that all material contained herein had been duly acknowledged.

Signed: __________________________

J M LEDWABA

Date: 17 NOVEMBER 2008
### BIBLIOGRAPHY

#### BOOKS

#### SOUTH AFRICA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Editions/Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Finnemore M. Van Rensburg R</td>
<td>Contemporary Labour Relations 2nd Ed (2002)</td>
<td>Butterworths, Durban</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Slabbert J A  
Managing Employment Relations in South Africa.  
(2007) Butterworths, Durban

Van Jaarsveld J & Van Eck S. Stephen  
Butterworths, Durban

GERMANY

Blanpain R  
Labour Law and Industrial Relations of Europian Community  

Blanpain R  

Blankpain R  
The council of Europe and the Social Challenges of the xxi 1st Century  
2000 Kluwer Law International, Great Britain

Blankpain R  
European Labour Law, 7th revised Ed. 2000, Kluwer The Hague
Schmidt W

Labour Law and Industrial Relations in German Law.
JOURNAL ARTICLES


Mischke C, Industrial Action in Germany (1992) 13 ILJ 1

Maenetje N H, Termination of Employment for economic, technological, structural or similar reasons (2000) ILJ 21 1562

Klock C E et al, Worker retrenchment: Preventative and remedial measures, ILR (1999) 138 1

Olivier M. Retrenchment: An Overview (1992) TSAR 104

Nazeer Cassim, Unfair dismissal (1984) 5 ILJ 275


SOUTH AFRICA


vii
- When does a continuing employment relationship become intolerable? Rochelle Le Roux.
# TABLE OF CASES

## SOUTH AFRICA

### A

- Associated Biscuits Ca division of Brands Ltd v Munsay (1997) 9 BLLR 1121 (LAC).

### B

- Bader Bop (Pty) Ltd v NUMSA (2002) ILJ 104 (LAC)
- Balaram v CCMA and others (2000) 9 BLLR 10105 (LC)
- Banks and Brown v Coca Cola South Africa J1114/07 June 2007
- BMD Knitting Mills (Pty) Ltd v SACTWU (2001) 7 BLLR 705 (LAC)
- Boxer Superstores Mthatha and another v Mbenya (2007) 8 BLLR 693 (SCA)
- Burger v Alert Engines Parts (Pty) Ltd (1999), BLLR 18 (LC)

### C

- Catering Pleasure and food Workers Union v National Brands Ltd (2007) 28 ILJ 1064 (LC)
- Chevron Engineering (Pty) Ltd v Nkambule and others (2003) 24 ILJ 1331 (SCA)
- Commercial Catering and Allied Workers Union and others v Status Hotel (1990) 11 ILJ 167 (IC)
- Consolidated Frame Cotton Corporation Ltd v President of the Industrial Court and Others (1987) ILJ 79 (D)
Consolidated Woolwashing and Processing Mills Ltd v President of the Industrial Court and Others (1986) (3) SA 786 (A)
CWIU and others v Latex Surgical Products (Pty) Ltd (2006) 2 BLLR 142 (LAC)

E

Edgars Stores Ltd v SACCAWU and another (1998) 19 ILJ 771 (LAC)
Ellias v Germiston Uitgewers (Pty) Ltd t/a Evalulab (1998) 19 ILJ 314 (LC)

F

FAWU and others v Breweries (2004) ILJ 1979 (LC)
Fedlife Assurance Ltd v Wolfaart (2000) ILJ 2407 (SCA)
Ferodo (Pty) Ltd v De Ruiter (1993) 14 ILJ 974 (LAC)
Food and Allied Workers Union v Kellog SA (1993) 14 ILJ 406 (IC)
Forecourt Express (Pty) Ltd v SATAWU and others (2007) 2 BLLR 101 (LAC)
Fry’s metals (Pty) Ltd v NUMSA and Others 2003 ILJ 133 (LAC)

G


H

I

Irvin & Johnson Ltd v Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration & others (2006) 27 ILJ 935,

Insurance of Banking Staff Association v Old Mutual Life Assurance Co. (2003) BLLR 1030 (CCMA)
IMATU v Northern Pretoria Metropolitan Substructure (1999) 20 ILJ 1018 (T)
Imperial Cold Storage & Supply Co. Ltd v Field (1993) 14 ILJ 1221 (LAC)

J

Jacot-Guilarmod v Provincial Government Gauteng (1999) 3 SA 594 (T)
Johnson and Johnson (Pty) Ltd v CWIU 1998 12 BLLR (LAC)

K

KEM-Lin Fashion v Brunton and another (2002) 23 ILJ 882 (LAC)
Key Delta v Marriner (1998) 6 BLLR 647 (E)

L

Langeveldt v Vryburg Transitional Local Council and others (2001) 22 ILJ 1116 (LAL)
Lilian Dudley v The City of cape Town and Another
Malelane Toyota v CCMA and others (1996) 6 BLLR 555 (LC)
Matthews v Glax SmithKline SA (Pty) Ltd (2006) 7 ILJ 876 (LC)
Media Workers Association of SA and others v SA Broadcasting Corporation (1986)
7 ILJ 438 (LC)
Mcossini v Mancotyana and another (1998) 9 ILJ 1413 (TK)
Minister of Correctional Services and another v Ngubo and others (2000) 21 313 (N)
Minister of Home Affairs v Hambridge NO and another 1999 ILJ 2632 (LC)
Mkangeli and others v Joubert and others 2001 (2) 1191 (CC): 2001 BCLR 316 (CC)
Mzeku and Other v Volkswagen SA (Pty) Ltd and Others 22 ILJ 1575 (LAC)

N

Natal Die Casting Co (Pty) Ltd v President, Industrial Court and Others (1987) 8 ILJ 245 (D)
National Union of Textile Workers v Seagift Surfwear Manufactures (Pty) Ltd (1985)
8 ILJ 438 (LC)
NEHAWU and others v Bader Bop (Pty) Ltd and another (2003) 24 ILJ 305 (CC)
NEHAWU v SA Institute for Medical Research (1997) 2 BLLR 146 (IC)
NEHAWU v University of Cape Town and others (2003) ILJ 95 (CC)
Nkopane and others v Independent Electoral Commission (2007) 2 BLLR 146 (LC)
NUMSA and others v Fry’s Metals (Pty) Ltd (2005) 26 ILJ 689 (SCA),
NUMSA and Others v SA Five Engineering and Others 2005 1 BLLR 53 (LC)
NUMSA v Driveline Technologies (Pty) Ltd and another [2002] 1 BLLR 20 (LAC)
NUMSA Botswana v Dimbaza Foundries (Pty) Ltd (2007) 9 BALR 816 (MEIBC)
NUM v Anglo American Records Laboratories (Pty) Ltd (2005) 2 BLLR (IC)
O
Oosthuizen v Telkom SA Ltd (2007) 28 ILJ 2531 (LAC)

P
Piliso v Old Mutual Life Assurance Company SA Ltd (2007) 28 ILJ 95 (CC)

R
Rustenburg Platinum Mines Ltd (Rustenburg Section) v CCMA and others (2006) 27 ILJ 207 (SCA)

S
SA Chemical Workers Union v Afrox Ltd (1999) 20 ILJ 1218 (LAC)
SA Commercial Catering and Allied Workers Union v Irvin & Johnson Ltd (2000) 21 ILJ 1583 (CC)
SACCCWU v Atok (Pty) Ltd [1999] 20 kg 1718 (LAC)
Sage v Four winds Transport Co (Pty) 1994) ILJ 1149 (IC)
SATAWU v Old Mutual Life Assurance Co SA Ltd [2005] 4 BLLR 378 (LC)
Simelela and others v Member of the Executive Council for Education of the Province of Eastern Cape and Others (2001) 22 ILJ 1688 (LC)
Stock Civil Engineering (Pty) Ltd Rip not others (2002) 23 IJL 358 (LAC)

T
Thekiso v IBM South Africa (Pty) Ltd) [2007] 3 BLLR 253 (LC)

xiii
Transnet Ltd v Chirwa (2006) ILJ 2076 (SCA)

Transwerk v Independent Mediation Service of South Africa and others (2002) 23 ILJ 358 (LAC)
Transport and General Workers Union v SA Stevedones (1993) 14 ILJ 1068 (IC)
Tyler v Donaldson Filtration Systems (Pty) Ltd (1999) 1 BLLR 89 (LC)

V

Visser v South African Institute for Medical Research (1998) 19 ILJ 1616 (LC)

W

Walts v Fidelity Corporate Services (Pty) Ltd [2007] 6BLLR 579 (LC)

X

Ximba and others LTA Earthworks (North) (1992) 13 ILJ 1513 (IC)

Z

Zero Appliances (Pty) Ltd v CCMA and others [2007] BLLR 683 (LC)

**GERMANY**

C

Commission of European Communities v Kingdom of Belgium; Case 215/83 (1985) ECJ 338
Commission v Italian Republic; Case 131/84 (1985) ECR 33

xiv
Commission of the European Committees v United Kingdom of Great Briain and Northern Ireland, Case- 382/92, ECR 1994, pp I – 2435

D

Dansk Metalarbeiderforbund and Special Arbeiderforbundet; Case 284/83
Denmark v Nielsen and Son Maskin fabrik a/s in liquidation (1985) ECR 553

L

Lauge v Lonmodtageres Garantifon; Case 250/97 (1998) ECR I – 8737
INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANISATION: CONVENTIONS, RECOMMENDATION AND OTHER PUBLICATIONS

Directive 75/129 EEC

Directive 92/56/EEC

Revised European Social Charter of 1961 is dated the 3/5/1996


EC Treaty, 1997

Committee of Experts, Termination of Employment General survey of Chapter III of ILO Convention 158

Termination of Employment Convention, 1982

ILO Resolution of International Standards on Termination of Employment Recommendation 119 of 1963
# TABLE OF STATUTES

## SOUTH AFRICA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>SHORT TITLE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>1956</td>
<td>Labour Relations Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200</td>
<td>1993</td>
<td>Interim Constitution of RSA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66</td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>Labour Relations Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>108</td>
<td>1996</td>
<td>Constitution of the Republic of S.A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Basic Conditions of Employment Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Promotion of Administrative Justice Act</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## GERMANY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>SHORT TITLE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01</td>
<td>1896</td>
<td>Civil Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>1969</td>
<td>Dismissal Protection Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-</td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>Works Constitution Act</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

**CHAPTER ONE**

1. Common Law .............................................. 1
   1.1 Introduction ........................................ 1-2
   1.2 The Impact of Section 23 of the Constitution .... 2
   1.3 Premature termination of a fixed-term contract of employment 3-4
   1.4 An indefinite contract of employment ............ 4-5

**CHAPTER TWO**

2. Dismissal for Operational Requirements during the Industrial Court era 6
   2.1 Introduction ........................................ 6
   2.2 South African Legal Position ....................... 6
      2.2.1 Historical Survey ............................... 7
      2.2.2 Sources ........................................ 8
         2.2.2.1 Common law ................................ 8
         2.2.2.2 Legislation .................................. 8
         2.2.2.3 Constitution ................................ 9
         2.2.2.4 Judicial precedents ......................... 9
         2.2.2.5 Academic writers ............................ 9
         2.2.2.6 International law ............................ 10
   2.3 German Legal System ................................. 10
      2.3.1 Historical Survey ............................... 10
      2.3.2 Sources ........................................ 10-11
         2.3.2.1 Judicial Precedents ......................... 11
         2.3.2.2 Academic writers ............................ 11
         2.3.2.3 Legislation .................................. 11-12
         2.3.2.4 International Law ............................ 12-13
         2.3.2.5 European Social Charter .................... 14
         2.3.2.6 Council Directive 98/59/EC .................. 14-15
CHAPTER THREE

3. Concept of collective redundancy in the South African Legal System 16
   3.1 Definition 16
   3.2 Description of the concept 16-17

CHAPTER FOUR

4. Dismissal based on Collective Redundancy in South Africa 18
   4.1 Application of Section 189A of the Labour Relations Act 18-19
   4.2 Substantive Fairness 19-20
      4.2.1 Fair reason 20-22
      4.2.2 Selection Criteria 22-23
      4.2.3 Procedural Fairness 23
      4.2.3.1 Notice of dismissal 23-24
      4.2.3.2 Failure to comply with fair procedure 24
      4.2.3.3 Consultation Process 24-25
      4.2.3.4 Facilitation Process 26-27
      4.2.3.5 Notice of Strike Action 27-28
   4.3 Role of involved actors in the South African Legal system 28
      4.3.1 Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration 28-30
      4.3.2 Bargaining Councils 30
      4.3.3 Labour Court 30-31
      4.3.4 Labour Appeal Court 31
      4.5.5 High Courts 32
      4.3.6 Supreme Court of Appeal 32-33
      4.3.7 Constitutional Court 33-34
      4.3.8 Private Arbitration 34
   4.4 Remedies in the South African Law 35
      4.4.1 Re-employment 35
      4.4.2 Compensation 36-37
      4.4.3 Re-Instatement 37-38
      4.4.4 Severance Pay 38-39
CHAPTER FIVE

5. Collective redundancy under German Legal System 40
5.1. Definition of collective redundancy 40-41
5.1.1 Consultation Process 41-42
5.1.2 Notice to competent authority 42-43
5.2. Remedies under German Law 43
5.2.1 Selection Criteria 43-44
5.2.2 Severance Pay 44
5.2.3 Compensation 44-46
5.2.4. Re-Instatement 46
5.3 Role involved actors under German Law 46
5.3.1 Courts 46-47
5.3.2. Conciliation Committees 47-48
5.3.3. Arbitration Committee 48
5.3.4 Works Council 48-50
5.3.5. Labour Office 50
5.3.6 Obligation to notify Labour Office 51-52

CHAPTER SIX

Conclusion 53-54