

**COMPARATIVE STUDY OF A DISMISSAL ON ACCOUNT OF
OPERATIONAL REQUIREMENTS BETWEEN SOUTH AFRICAN AND
GERMAN LABOUR LAW**

By: JACK MALESELA LEDWABA
B. JURIS (UNIN), LLB (UNIN), DIP IN DRAFTING AND INTERPRETATION OF
CONTRACT(UJ), DIP IN LEGISLATIVE DRAFTING (VISTA)

Advocate of the High Court of South Africa.

DISSERTATION – ML70DIS

Submitted in part fulfilment of the requirements for

MASTER OF LAWS DEGREE

(LLM – Labour Law)

**DEPARTMENT OF MERCANTILE LAW
FACULTY OF MANAGEMENT SCIENCES AND LAW**

**UNIVERSITY OF LIMPOPO
(SCHOOL OF LAW)**

Private Bag 1106
SOVENGA
0727

REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: MR M.C. LEBEA
BProc, LLB (UNIN), Dipl Corporate Law (Cum Laude)(RAU),
LLM LABOUR LAW (CORNELI UNV)

Preface

Thanks expressed in this work to many people who have contributed directly and indirectly to this work, either by unintended inspiration or by helpful comments and assistance, are extended. I wish in particular to record my indebtedness to the General Manager for Legal Services of the Office of the Premier Adv. P C Rammutla with whom I work, and to the fellow students, and colleagues whose insights are reflected in these pages. A dissertation of this nature cannot be produced without the dedication of people whose contribution would not be recognized without acknowledgment. These people include Mr M C Lebea, my supervisor, whose careful proof reading will hopefully have assisted in removing those annoying typographical and stylistic errors that managed to slip uncorrected from one earlier draft to this one. Finally, I wish once again to thank my personal assistant and a fellow colleague, Ella Nkoana without whose unfailing help and support in this and other endeavours the completion of this dissertation would not have been possible. To her, once again and to my domestic worker Ms Tlou Francina Marwala, this dissertation is dedicated, with deep sense of appreciation.

Advocate Jack Malesela Ledwaba
Author

University of Limpopo
2008

DECLARATION

I declare that the dissertation hereby submitted to the University of Limpopo for the degree of Master of Laws has not been previously submitted by me for the degree at this or any other University; that it is my own work in design and in execution; and that all material contained herein had been duly acknowledged.

Signed: _____
J M LEDWABA

Date: **17 NOVEMBER 2008**

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS

SOUTH AFRICA

- Brassey et al The New Labour Law (1987) Juta.
Johannesburg
- Cheadle Le Roux, Thompson & Van Niekerk Current Labour Law (2007)
18th Ed. Juta. Kenwyn
- Finnemore M. Van Rensburg R Contemporary Labour
Relations 2nd Ed (2002).
Butterworths, Durban
- Grogan J Dismissal Discrimination and Unfair
Labour Practices. 2nd Ed (2007).
Juta. Lansdowne
- Grogan J. Labour Law: A Comprehensive
Guide 5th Ed. (2006) Juta
Grahamstown
- Grogan J. Workplace Law 7th Ed (2007). Juta.
Grahamstown
- Grogan J. Dismissal (2002) Juta.
Grahamstown

Slabbert J A

Managing Employment

Relations in South Africa.

(2007) Butterworths . Durban

Van Jaarsveld J & Van Eck S. Stephen

Principles of Labour Law (2002)

Butterworths. Durban

GERMANY

Blanpain R

Labour Law and Industrial

Relations of European Community

(1991) Kluwer. Deventer

Blanpain R

Comparative Law and Industrial

Relations (1987) 3rd Ed. Kluwer

Deventer

Blankpain R

The council of Europe and the Social

Challenges of the xxi 1st Century

2000 Kluwer Law International.

Great Britain

Blankpain R

European Labour Law, 7th revised

Ed. 2000. Kluwer The Hague

Schmidt W

Labour Law and Industrial
Relations in German Law,
(2000) 3rd Ed. Kluwer. The
Hague

JOURNAL ARTICLES

Blanpain R., Corporate Restructuring and Rule of Labour Law p.95 Kluwer Law International 2003, the Hague, London, New York

Mischke C, Industrial Action in Germany (1992) 13 ILJ 1

Maenette N H, Termination of Employment for economic, technological, structural or similar reasons (2000) ILJ 21 1562

Klock C E et al, Worker retrenchment: Preventative and remedial measures, ILR (1999) 138 1

Olivier M. Retrenchment: An Overview (1992) TSAR 104

Nazeer Cassim, Unfair dismissal (1984) 5 ILJ 275

Yemin, The influence of the ILO (1984) 18 ILJ 279

SOUTH AFRICA

(A comment on the Labour Relations Amendment Bill 2001 and the Basic Conditions of Employment Bill 2001 (2001) 22 ILJ 2164 Andre' Van Niekerk, PAK Le Roux.)

Aspects of the South African Law on retrenchment in the light of English Labour Standards (1990) 11 ILJ 1193 Andrew Breitenbuch.

A survey of the 2002 Labour Legislation Amendments: Is these really “something for every (2003) ILJ, Graig Bosch.

Transfer, closure and insolvency of undertakings (1991) 12 ILJ, 935, B Jordaan.

Unfair Dismissal – (2004) 25 ILJ 896, Chris Todd & Graham Damant.

- When does a continuing employment relationship become intolerable? Rochelle Le Roux.

TABLE OF CASES

SOUTH AFRICA

A

Associated Biscuits Ca division of Brands Ltd v Munsay (1997) 9 BLLR 1121 (LAC).

B

Bader Bop (Pty) Ltd v NUMSA (2002) ILJ 104 (LAC)

Balaram v CCMA and others (2000) 9 BLLR 10105 (LC)

Banks and Brown v Coca Cola South Africa J1114/07 June 2007

BMD Knitting Mills (Pty) Ltd v SACTWU (2001) 7 BLLR 705 (LAC)

Boxer Superstores Mthatha and another v Mbenya (2007) 8 BLLR 693 (SCA)

Burger v Alert Engines Parts (Pty) Ltd (1999), BLLR 18 (LC)

Buthelezi v Municipal Demarcation Board (2004) 25 ILJ 20317 (LAC)

C

Catering Pleasure and food Workers Union v National Brands Ltd (2007) 28 ILJ 1064 (LC)

CEPPWAWU & Another v Glass & Aluminium 2000 CC (2002) 23 ILJ 695 (LAC)

Chevron Engineering (Pty) Ltd v Nkambule and others (2003) 24 ILJ 1331 (SCA)

Commercial Catering and Allied Workers Union and others v Status Hotel (1990) 11 ILJ 167 (IC)

Consolidated Frame Cotton Corporation Ltd v President of the Industrial Court and Others (1987) ILJ 79 (D)

Consolidated Woolwashing and Processing Mills Ltd v President of the Industrial Court and Others (1986) (3) SA 786 (A)

CWIU and others v Latex Surgical Products (Pty) Ltd (2006) 2 BLLR 142 (LAC)

E

Edgars Stores Ltd v SACCAWU and another (1998) 19 ILJ 771 (LAC)

Ellias v Germiston Uitgewers (Pty) Ltd t/a Evalulab (1998) 19 ILJ 314 (LC)

F

FAWU and others v Breweries (2004) ILJ 1979 (LC)

Fedlife Assurance Ltd v Wolfaart (2000) ILJ 2407 (SCA)

Ferodo (Pty) Ltd v De Ruiter (1993) 14 ILJ 974 (LAC)

Food and Allied Workers Union v Kellogg SA (1993) 14 ILJ 406 (IC)

Forecourt Express (Pty) Ltd v SATAWU and others (2007) 2 BLLR 101 (LAC)

Fry's metals (Pty) Ltd v NUMSA and Others 2003 ILJ 133 (LAC)

G

Greyvenstein v flaming Silver Trading 62 (Pty) Ltd t/u Sunglass World (2007) ILG 1081 (LC).

H

Harper v Morgan Guarantee Trust Company of New York, Johannesburg and another (2004) 3 SA 253 (W)

I

Irvin & Johnson Ltd v Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration & others (2006) 27 ILJ 935,

Insurance of Banking Staff Association v Old Mutual Life Assurance Co. (2003) BLLR 1030 (CCMA)

IMATU v Northern Pretoria Metropolitan Substructure (1999) 20 ILJ 1018 (T)

Imperial Cold Storage & Supply Co. Ltd v Field (1993) 14 ILJ 1221 (LAC)

J

Jacot-Guilarmod v Provincial Government Gauteng (1999) 3 SA 594 (T)

Johnson and Johnson (Pty) Ltd v CWIU 1998 12 BLLR (LAC)

K

KEM-Lin Fashion v Brunton and another (2002) 23 ILJ 882 (LAC)

Key Delta v Marriner (1998) 6 BLLR 647 (E)

Khosa, Gypsum Industries Ltd (1998) 19 ILJ 53 (LAC)

L

Langeveldt v Vryburg Transitional Local Council and others (2001) 22 ILJ 1116 (LAL)

Leoni Wiring Systems (East London) (Ltd) v National Union of Metalworkers of SA & others (2007) 28 ILJ 642 (LC)

Lilian Dudley v The City of cape Town and Another

M

Malelane Toyota v CCMA and others (1996) 6 BLLR 555 (LC)
Matthews v Glax SmithKline SA (Pty) Ltd (2006) 7 ILJ 876 (LC)
Media Workers Association of SA and others v SA Broadcasting Corporation (1986)
7 ILJ 438 (LC)
Mcosini v Mancotyana and another (1998) 9 ILJ 1413 (TK)
Minister of Correctional Services and another v Ngubo and others (2000) 21 313 (N)
Minister of Home Affairs v Hambridge NO and another 1999 ILJ 2632 (LC)
Mkangeli and others v Joubert and others 2001 (2) 1191 (CC): 2001 BCLR 316 (CC)
Mzeku and Other v Volkswagen SA (Pty) Ltd and Others 22 ILJ 1575 (LAC)

N

Natal Die Casting Co (Pty) Ltd v President, Industrial Court and Others (1987) 8 ILJ
245 (D)
National Union of Textile Workers v Seagift Surfwear Manufactures (Pty) Ltd (1985)
8 ILJ 438 (LC)
NEHAWU and others v Bader Bop (Pty) Ltd and another (2003) 24 ILJ 305 (CC)
NEHAWU v SA Institute for Medical Research (1997 (2) BLLR 146 (IC)
NEHAWU v University of Cape Town and others (2003) ILJ 95 (CC)
Nkopane and others v Independent Electoral Commission (2007) 2 BLLR 146 (LC)
NUMSA and others v Fry's Metals (Pty) Ltd (2005) 26 ILJ 689 (SCA),
NUMSA and Others v SA Five Engineering and Others 2005 1 BLLR 53 (LC)
NUMSA v Driveline Technologies (Pty) Ltd and another [2002] 1 BLLR 20 (LAC)
NUMSA Botswana v Dimbaza Foundries (Pty) Ltd (2007) 9 BALR 816 (MEIBC)
NUM v Anglo American Records Laboratories (Pty) Ltd (2005) 2 BLLR (IC)
NUM v De Beers Consolidated Mines (Pty) Ltd (2006) 27 ILJ 1909 (LC)

O

Oosthuizen v Telkom SA Ltd (2007) 28 ILJ 2531 (LAC)

P

Piliso v Old Mutual Life Assurance Company SA Ltd (2007) 28 ILJ 95 (CC)

R

Rustenburg Platinum Mines Ltd (Rustenburg Section) v CCMA and others (2006) 27 ILJ 207 (SCA)

S

SA Chemical Workers Union v Afrox Ltd (1999) 20 ILJ 1218 (LAC)

SA Commercial Catering and Allied Workers Union v Irvin & Johnson Ltd (2000) 21 ILJ 1583 (CC)

SACCWU v Atok (Pty) Ltd [1999] 20 kg 1718 (LAC)

Sage v Four winds Transport Co (Pty) 1994) ILJ 1149 (IC)

SATAWU v Old Mutual Life Assurance Co SA Ltd [2005] 4 BLLR 378 (LC)

Simelela and others v Member of the Executive Council for Education of the Province of Eastern Cape and Others (2001) 22 ILJ 1688 (LC)

Stock Civil Engineering (Pty) Ltd Rip not others (2002) 23 IJL 358 (LAC)

T

Thekiso v IBM South Africa (Pty) Ltd [2007] 3 BLLR 253 (LC)

Transnet Ltd v Chirwa (2006) ILJ 2076 (SCA)

Transwerk v Independent Mediation Service of South Africa and others (2002) 23 ILJ 358 (LAC)

Transport and General Workers Union v SA Stevedones (1993) 14 ILJ 1068 (IC)

Tyler v Donaldson Filtration Systems (Pty) Ltd (1999) 1 BLLR 89 (LC)

V

Visser v South African Institute for Medical Research (1998) 19 ILJ 1616 (LC)

W

Walts v Fidelity Corporate Services (Pty) Ltd [2007] 6BLLR 579 (LC)

X

Ximba and others LTA Earthworks (North) (1992) 13 ILJ 1513 (IC)

Z

Zero Appliances (Pty) Ltd v CCMA and others [2007] BLLR 683 (LC)

GERMANY

C

Commission of European Communities v Kingdom of Belgium; Case 215/83 (1985) ECJ 338

Commission v Italian Republic; Case 131/84 (1985) ECR 33

Commission of the European Committees v United Kingdom of Great Briain and Northern Ireland, Case- 382/92, ECR 1994, pp I – 2435

D

Dansk Metalarbejderforbund and Special Arbejderforbundet; Case 284/83

Denmark v Nielsen and Son Maskin fabrik a/s in liquidation (1985) ECR 553

L

Lauge v Lonmodtagernes Garantifon; Case 250/97 (1998) ECR I – 8737

**INTERNATIONAL LABOUR ORGANISATION: CONVENTIONS,
RECOMMENDATION AND OTHER PUBLICATIONS**

Directive 75/129 EEC

Directive 92/56/EEC

Revised European Social Charter of 1961 is dated the 3/5/1996

Council Directive 98/59/EC of July 1998. This Directive is a codified revised version of Directives 75/129/EEC and 92/56/EEC, which have been repealed

EC Treaty, 1997

Committee of Experts, Termination of Employment General survey of Chapter III of ILO Convention 158

Termination of Employment Convention, 1982

ILO Resolution of International Standards on Termination of Employment Recommendation 119 of 1963

TABLE OF STATUTES

SOUTH AFRICA

28	1956	Labour Relations Act
200	1993	Interim Constitution of RSA
66	1995	Labour Relations Act
108	1996	Constitution of the Republic of S.A
75	1997	Basic Conditions of Employment Act
03	2000	Promotion of Administrative Justice Act

GERMANY

NO	YEAR	SHORT TITLE
01	1896	Civil Code
13	1969	Dismissal Protection Act
-	2001	Works Constitution Act

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGES
CHAPTER ONE	
1. Common Law	1
1.1 Introduction	1-2
1.2 The Impact of Section 23 of the Constitution	2
1.3 Premature termination of a fixed-term contract of employment	3-4
1.4 An indefinite contract of employment	4-5
CHAPTER TWO	
2. Dismissal for Operational Requirements during the Industrial Court era	6
2.1 Introduction	6
2.2 South African Legal Position	6
2.2.1 Historical Survey	7
2.2.2 Sources	8
2.2.2.1 Common law	8
2.2.2.2 Legislation	8
2.2.2.3 Constitution	9
2.2.2.4 Judicial precedents	9
2.2.2.5 Academic writers	9
2.2.2.6 International law	10
2.3 German Legal System	10
2.3.1 Historical Survey	10
2.3.2 Sources	10-11
2.3.2.1 Judicial Precedents	11
2.3.2.2 Academic writers	11
2.3.2.3 Legislation	11-12
2.3.2.4 International Law	12-13
2.3.2.5 European Social Charter	14
2.3.2.6 Council Directive 98/59/EC	14-15

CHAPTER THREE

3.	Concept of collective redundancy in the South African Legal System	16
3.1	Definition	16
3.2	Description of the concept	16-17

CHAPTER FOUR

4.	Dismissal based on Collective Redundancy in South Africa	18
4.1	Application of Section 189A of the Labour Relations Act	18-19
4.2.	Substantive Fairness	19-20
4.2.1	Fair reason	20-22
4.2.2	Selection Criteria	22-23
4.2.3	Procedural Fairness	23
4.2.3.1	Notice of dismissal	23-24
4.2.3.2	Failure to comply with fair procedure	24
4.2.3.3	Consultation Process	24-25
4.2.3.4	Facilitation Process	26-27
4.2.3.5	Notice of Strike Action	27-28
4.3	Role of involved actors in the South African Legal system	28
4.3.1	Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration	28-30
4.3.2	Bargaining Councils	30
4.3.3	Labour Court	30-31
4.3.4	Labour Appeal Court	31
4.5.5	High Courts	32
4.3.6	Supreme Court of Appeal	32-33
4.3.7	Constitutional Court	33-34
4.3.8	Private Arbitration	34
4.4	Remedies in the South African Law	35
4.4.1	Re-employment	35
4.4.2	Compensation	36-37
4.4.3	Re-Instatement	37-38
4.4.4	Severance Pay	38-39

CHAPTER FIVE

5.	Collective redundancy under German Legal System	40
5.1.	Definition of collective redundancy	40-41
5.1.1	Consultation Process	41-42
5.1.2	Notice to competent authority	42-43
5.2.	Remedies under German Law	43
5.2.1	Selection Criteria	43-44
5.2.2	Severance Pay	44
5.2.3	Compensation	44-46
5.2.4.	Re-Instatement	46
5.3	Role involved actors under German Law	46
5.3.1	Courts	46-47
5.3.2.	Conciliation Committees	47-48
5.3.3.	Arbitration Committee	48
5.3.4	Works Council	48-50
5.3.5.	Labour Office	50
5.3.6	Obligation to notify Labour Office	51-52

CHAPTER SIX

	Conclusion	53-54
--	------------	-------